92-00426/

CONTENTS

Executive Summary p. i

Acknowledgements p. xi

PART 1: INTRODUCTION, BACKGROUND AND METHODOLOGY p. 1-1

1.1 Study Design and Methodology p. 1-2

1.1.1 Document and Literature Search p. 1-2
1.1.2. Survey p. 1-2
1.1.3 Case Studies p. 1-3

1.2 Report Contents p. 1-3

PART 2: SURVEY FINDINGS p. 2-1

2.1 Survey Recipients p. 2-1

2.2 Survey Respondents p. 2-1

2.2.1 Respondents by Categories p. 2-2
2.2.2 Respondents by Province p. 2-2

2.3 Survey Findings p. 2-3

2.3.1 Part I: Race/Ethnic Relations Programs,Policies and Plans p. 2-3

A Race/Ethnic Relations Committees p. 2-3
B Municipal Policy p. 2-9
C Community Outreach and Communication p. 2-10
D Access and Employment p. 2-12
E Education and Training p. 2-14

2.3.2 Part II: FCM Race Relations Program and Initiatives p. 2-15

1. Familiarity with FCM Program p. 2-15
2. Usefulness of FCM Program/ Initiatives p. 2-16
3. Influence of FCM Race Relations Program p. 2-17

2.4 Analysis of Survey Results p. 2-18

2.4.1 Municipal Race Relations Initiatives p. 2-18

2.4.2 Respondents' Views About the FCM Race Relations Program p. 2-19

2.5 The Context p. 2-19

PART 3: CASE STUDIES p. 3-1

3.1 General p. 3.1

3.1.1 Race Relations Issues-An Overview p. 3-1

3.1.2 Reporting of Case Studies p. 3-4

3.2 Vancouver p. 3-5

3.3 Saskatoon p. 3-14

3.4 Winnipeg p. 3-20

3.5 Toronto p. 3-26

3.6 Montreal p. 3-36

3.7 Halifax p. 3-47

PART 4: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS p. 4-1

4.1 Municipal Race Relations Initiatives Since 1984 p. 4-1

4.2 The FCM Race Relations Program p. 4-3

4.3 The Challenge in Race Relations p. 4-6

4.4. Need for a Greater Effort p. 4-8

4.4.1 Objectives of FCM Program p. 4-8
4.4.2 Program Structure p. 4-10
4.4 3 Program Activities p. 4-12

APPENDICES p. 1

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix 1/1	Survey Questionnaire	p. 1
Appendix 2/1	FCM Survey: Questionnaire Distribution & Respondents	p. 13
Appendix 2/2	FCM Survey Respondents by Province, Municipality & Identification	p. 14
Appendix 2/3	FCM Survey Recipients and Respondents by Province/Territory	p. 17
Appendix 2/4	Accomplishments of Race Relations Committees	p. 18
Appendix 2/5	Effectiveness of Municipal Race/ Ethnic Relations Committees	p. 21
Appendix 2/6	Familiarity with FCM Race Relations Program	p. 22
Appendix 2/7	Usefulness of FCM Program	p. 23
Appendix 2/8	Influence of FCM Program	p. 25
Appendix 2/9	Recommendations for Improving FCM Program and New Initiatives	p. 27
Appendix 3/1	List of People Interviewed and Consulted	p. 35

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Federation of Canadian Municipalities (FCM) is the national organization that represents the interests of local governments across Canada.

The FCM works with representatives of the Government of Canada to ensure that the municipal viewpoint is known and reflected in federal policies, programs and legislation affecting local government. It works closely with municipal organizations of the provinces and territories of Canada.

Its membership includes 575 municipalities throughout Canada and 15 provincial/territorial municipal organizations. Over 70 % of Canada's population resides in FCM's member municipalities.

In June 1984, FCM responded to recommendation #11 in the Equality Now report of the Special House of Commons Committee on Participation of Visible Minorities in the Canadian society. This marked the beginning of FCM's involvement in race relations at the municipal level.

Since then, FCM has undertaken a number of initiatives as part of its Race Relations Program.

This report presents the findings, conclusions and recommendations of the Impact Study and Assessment of the FCM Municipal Race Relations Program.

1. STUDY DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

The study was conducted in three phases: 1. A document and literature search, 2. A comprehensive survey of selected municipalities, community organizations, municipal race relations committees and institutional representatives, and, 3. Case studies of six municipalities.

The document and literature search involved culling of FCM material and files and reviewing of numerous documents and publications. These materials were received from respondents of the survey questionnaire and municipal officials and community members interviewed in connection with the case studies.

A comprehensive 12-page questionnaire was mailed on May 4, 1990, to 264 selected recipients including municipalities, visible minority/ethnic community organizations, municipal race/community relations committees, and institutional representatives.

78 questionnaires, 29.6 % of the total, were returned. Of these, two were too late for processing. The survey results, therefore, are based on responses of 76 recipients.

Case studies were conducted in six cities: Vancouver, Saskatoon, Winnipeg, Toronto, Montreal, and Halifax. In each city, personal interviews were held with elected/appointed municipal government officials and individual/group meetings were held with community organizations and in three cities, with municipal race relations committees. Where it was not possible to meet with an individual, telephone interview was held.

Case studies were designed to seek information on race relations issues and actions undertaken by municipalities in dealing with the issues. Information was also sought from participants on whether they were familiar with the FCM Race Relations Program and, what suggestions they might have about the role FCM could play in improving race relations in their municipalities.

2 FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

The study leads to the following conclusions:

2.1 A GREAT DEAL OF ACTIVITY HAS TAKEN PLACE IN RACE RELATIONS AT THE MUNICIPAL LEVEL IN CANADA SINCE THE FCM FIRST TOOK ITS INITIATIVE IN 1984.

- an increased number of municipal race relations committees
- more municipal employment equity programs
- an increased number of municipalities with race relations policies
- a greater emphasis on training for staff and managers
- an increased emphasis on community outreach

2.2 THE FCM RACE RELATIONS PROGRAM IS MEETING ITS OBJECTIVE OF PROMOTING INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE AND IMPROVED RACE RELATIONS IN CANADIAN MUNICIPALITIES.

- 82.9 % of the survey respondents indicated some degree of familiarity with FCM's Municipal Race Relations Program

- over 27,000 copies of the three "How To" manuals have been distributed to municipalities, school boards, police forces, public libraries, racial and ethnocultural community organizations and others

- promotion of March 21, International Day for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

- National and Regional Symposia which brought together representatives of municipalities, provincial and federal governments, racial and ethnic minority communities, immigrant and refugees serving agencies, and others involved and interested in multiculturalism and race relations

- Workshops and seminars at Annual Conferences

2.3 CANADIAN MUNICIPALITIES, AND BY EXTENSION FCM, FACE AN ENORMOUS CHALLENGE IN RACE RELATIONS.

The challenge comes from:

- an increase in racial tensions in many Canadian cities as reflected in public opinion polls and as evidenced by increasing number of incidents of racial discrimination in policing, the justice system, employment and other walks of life

- forces impacting on FCM's Program:

  . demographics within municipalities
  . the organization and structure of municipal governments
  . the dynamics of local racial/ethnic minority communities
  . the leadership of elected/appointed municipal officials
  . national trends and developments in race relations
  . FCM's own mandate and mission

2.4 THERE IS A CRITICAL NEED FOR A MUCH GREATER EFFORT AT BOTH THE MUNICIPAL LEVEL AND AT THE FCM TO FACE THE CHALLENGE OF THE 1990'S.

To face the challenge to race relations in the 1990's, municipalities and FCM will need to expend a much greater effort.

Case studies in the six cities have indicated that issues which were of concern to racial minority communities in 1984 are still relevant. These issues are:

1 Employment within Municipal Government Services

2 Policing and Enforcement of Law and Order

3 Spread of Vandalism, Graffiti, Racist Pins, Buttons and Hate Literature

4 Access to a Wide Range of Municipal Services and Institutions

5 Commitment of Elected/Appointed Municipal Officials

6 Effective Communication with Racial/Ethnic Minority Communities

The extent of concern with each one of the above issues varies from one city to another. And, there are other issues specific to a particular city (for example, the language issue in Montreal). Nevertheless, concern about the above six issues is common, in varying degrees, to every city under study.

Concerns with regard to these issues existed in 1984 when FCM launched its Program. Now, however, the intensity of racial minorities' concerns has, if anything, increased. This is a result of demographic trends, economic conditions and national events which impact on race relations at the municipal level and influence the FCM program.

To deal with these and other race relations issues at the municipal level, a bold, pro-active approach and well-defined plan of action will be necessary.

3. RECOMMENDATIONS

The following recommendations are made to assist FCM in charting the future course of action for its Race Relations Program.

Recommendation 1:

That the objectives of the Program be clearly spelled out and expanded by adding:

advocacy on race relations issues

sensitization of elected and appointed municipal representatives

provision of advice and guidance to municipalities in achieving institutional change

monitoring of municipal race relations programs

facilitating resolution of race relations problems

networking with other institutions which are pursuing programs with similar objectives

Recommendation 2:

That the FCM Program be mandated to play a more pro-active role in meeting its objectives.

Recommendation 3:

That the structure and membership of the National Action Committee (NAC) be reviewed to include:

representatives from the Aboriginal Peoples' communities and youth.

Recommendation 4:

That in appointing the above members, particular attention be given to increasing female representation.

Recommendation 5:

That Regional Sub-committees of NAC be established in five regions to cater specifically to regional concerns.

That in appointing members on Regional Sub-Committees, knowledge of municipal operations should be an important criterion.

Recommendation 6:

That the staff complement of the FCM Race Relations Program be increased to assist the Race Relations Co-ordinator.

Recommendation 7:

That consideration be given to ways and means of sensitizing the FCM Board of Directors more regularly about race relations issues.

Recommendation 8:

That race relations and multicultural dimensions be integrated in the work of other FCM Standing Committees (such as the Standing Committees on Heritage, Art and Culture, Economic Development, and Housing) through a closer liaison between NAC and other committees.

Recommendation 9:

That a newsletter on municipal race relations, distributed quarterly, be published by the FCM.

That persons knowledgeable about race relations in the municipal context be invited to write articles in the proposed newsletter.

Recommendation 10:

That a greater use be made of the ethnic media in publicizing the FCM and municipal initiatives in race relations.

Recommendation 11:

That two regional symposia be held every year to focus specifically on the issues of regional concern.

Recommendation 12:

That working sessions on specific aspect of municipal services like employment equity and contract compliance, health, housing, public works, planning, parks and recreation, and economic development be held to focus on specific issues. These working sessions may be held in conjunction with FCM Annual Conferences.

Recommendation 13:

That similar working sessions be held on issues of concerns to Aboriginal and racial minority women, youth and seniors.

Recommendation 14:

That contacts and communication with ethnocultural communities be improved through networking with national ethnocultural organizations.

Recommendation 15:

That ongoing communication be initiated with other national institutions (e.g. the Canadian Labour Congress, Canadian Bankers Association, Canadian Chamber of Commerce, etc.) pursuing objectives similar to those of the FCM Program.

Recommendation 16:

That actions be initiated with municipal officials in selected cities in other countries (e.g. New York,Chicago, Los Angeles, London, Paris, Bonn,etc.) to exchange information on their programs on race relations.

Recommendation 17:

That advocacy on race relations issues be specifically added as a stated objective of the FCM Race Relations Program.

Recommendation 18:

That, once a year, the FCM Race Relations Co-ordinator meet with municipal officials responsible for dealing with race relations issues in every region either at regional or national gatherings.

Recommendation 19:

That the FCM prepare an inventory of resource people in municipalities/community organizations who could assist and guide municipalities, especially smaller municipalities with limited resources, in specific areas of concern.

Recommendation 20:

That the FCM take steps to sensitize City Council members and senior municipal bureaucrats of municipalities, where necessary.

Recommendation 21:

That "How To" manuals be published on such matters as:

- networking with racial and Aboriginal communities at the local levels
- race relations in public libraries and other local institutions
- the institutional change process and mechanisms necessary to achieve it
- concerns of women, youth and seniors

Recommendation 22:

That "How To" manuals be distributed to national ethnocultural organizations and local multicultural/immigrant service centres.

Recommendation 23:

That the resource centre be augmented with more space, material, and staff time so that the FCM could play the role of a clearing house of information and ideas more effectively.

Recommendation 24:

That a plan of action with a strategy be developed to achieve improvements in the following areas:

race relations committees
employment equity/contract compliance
access to municipal services
race relations and cross-cultural training

Recommendation 25:

That the plan of action provide special consideration to deal with the concerns of:

smaller municipalities, and
racial minority women, youth and seniors.

PROPOSED COURSE OF ACTION

A number of recommendations are made in Part 4 of the report for consideration by the National Action Committee. The following are a few of the major proposed actions:

1. Co-sponsor a major event on March 21 at the national level in cooperation with CEC and AFN, and provide guidelines and assistance to municipalities in holding events on March 21 with a view to ensure a greater municipal focus.
2. A review and re-definition of the objectives of FCM Race Relations Program and NAC including restructuring the membership.

3. Holding regional symposa, in at least two these regions: B.C., Prairie Provinces, Province of Quebec, or Northwestern Ontario.

4. Publication of information flyers on specific communities/ groups, e.g. Sikhs, Aboriginal Peoples, Women, Youth, Seniors.

5. Holding working sessions on at least two of these issues: employment equity and contract compliance, health, housing, parks and recreation. And, developing guidelines for municipal action based on these sessions.

6. Initiate more effective direct advisory services to medium and smaller-sized municipalities.

7. Prepare "How To" manuals on youth employment program and institutional change in municipal bodies such as libraries.

8. Review effectiveness of municipal race relations committees and develop guidelines for initiating and developing them.

9. Publish substantive articles on race relations issues in the FORUM.

10. Increase contact and communication between NAC and FCM Board on a regular basis to inform the Board on race relations issues.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many people have assisted and given generously of their time and efforts in various phases of the project.

In conducting the case studies, help provided by the following people in scheduling meetings and providing information was most valuable.

Judy Rogers and Norma-Jean McLaren of the City of Vancouver's Equal Employment Opportunity Division; Aziz Khaki of the Committee for Racial Justice and Louise Sorensen of the Affiliation of Multicultural Societies and Service Agencies of B.C.;

Hameed Javed, Chair of the Saskatoon Race Relations Committee and Shelley Chirpilo, Employment Equity Co-ordinator of the City of Saskatoon;

Sharron Gould, Employment Equity Co-ordinator of the City of Winnipeg and Harold Rampersad of Winnipeg's Community/Race Relations Committee;

Janice Dembo, Co-ordinator of Toronto Mayor's Committee on Community and Race Relations and also a member of the FCM's National Action Committee; Mary Bruce, Director of the Equal Employment Opportunity Division of the City of Toronto;

Helene Fotopulos, Political Attache of the Executive Committee and Karin Michnick of the City of Montreal; Fo Niemi of the Centre for Research-Action on Race Relations in Montreal;

Charla N. R. Williams, Employment Equity Co-ordinator of the City of Halifax; and, Vivian Stephen and Mokhtyar Tomar of the Multicultural Association of Nova Scotia.

Cyril Dabydeen, FCM's Race Relations Co-ordinator, made himself readily available with his ideas and information. His suggestions were extremely valuable. Also at FCM, Sylvie Delaquis provided assistance in culling FCM documents and in the distribution of the survey questionnaire. Her support is gratefully acknowledged.

Last, but not the least, I am indebted to my wife, Heather, for providing administrative and organizational support as well as for undertaking the enormous task of editing this report.

PART 1: INTRODUCTION, BACKGROUND AND METHODOLOGY

The Federation of Canadian Municipalities (FCM) is the national organization that represents the interests of local governments across Canada.

FCM works with representatives of the Government of Canada to ensure that the municipal viewpoint is known and reflected in federal policies, programs and legislation affecting local government. It works closely with municipal organizations of the provinces and territories of Canada.

Its membership includes 575 municipalities throughout Canada and 15 provincial/territorial municipal organizations. Over 70 % of Canada's population resides in FCM's member municipalities.

In June 1984, FCM responded to recommendation #11 in the Equality Now report of the Special House of Commons Committee on Participation of Visible Minorities in the Canadian society. This marked the beginning of FCM's involvement in race relations at the municipal level.

Since then, FCM has undertaken a number of initiatives. Thus, in June, 1985, FCM commissioned a study of municipal race relations initiatives in Canada. At the same time a Technical Advisory Committee was formed to provide guidance and support for the study.

In February 1986, the FCM sponsored a National Symposium on Multiculturalism and Race Relations. This symposium attracted elected and appointed municipal, provincial and federal government officials and racial and cultural community organizations from across Canada. As part of the symposium proceedings, a survey report on municipal initiatives for improving race relations and a resource kit were presented.

These activities led to the approval by the FCM, at the 1986 Annual Conference, of a Policy Statement entitled "Improving Race Relations in Canadian Municipalities". To implement the Policy Statement, FCM formed the National Action Committee (NAC) comprised of elected municipal officials and prominent members of racial minority communities.

Since then, NAC has played a key role in advocating and promoting FCM's Race Relations Program and a number of actions have been taken. These include: appointment of a Race Relations officer, publication of three "How To" manuals, and holding of another National Symposium in 1989 and a Regional Symposium in 1990. A latter section lists FCM initiatives in detail.

The main objective of the FCM Race Relations Program is to promote institutional change and improved race relations in Canadian municipalities.

This paper presents the findings, conclusions and recommendations of the Impact Study and Assessment of the FCM Municipal Race Relations Program.

1.1 STUDY DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

The study was conducted in three phases: 1. A document and literature search, 2. A comprehensive survey of selected municipalities, community organizations, municipal race relations committees and institutional representatives, and, 3. Case studies of six municipalities.

1.1.1 Document and Literature Search

This has been an ongoing process throughout the study. It began with culling of FCM material and files and continued on to reviewing numerous documents and publications received from respondents of the survey questionnaire and municipal officials and community members interviewed in connection with the case studies.

1.1.2 Survey

A comprehensive 12-page questionnaire was mailed on May 4, 1990, to 264 selected recipients as follows:

115	Municipalities
63	Visible Minority/Ethnic Community Organizations
36	Municipal Race Relations Committees
50	Institutional Representatives
264	Total

The questionnaire was divided into two parts. Part 1 consisted of questions related to municipal Race/Ethnic Relations Programs, Policies and Plans, whereas Part 2 asked recipients specific questions about the FCM Race Relations Program and Initiatives.

Part I was further sub-divided into five sections: A. Race/Ethnic Relations Committee, B. Municipal Race/Ethnic Relations Policy, C. Community Outreach and Communication, D. Access and Employment, and E. Education and Training.

Part II contained three questions which asked recipients about their familiarity with the FCM Program and Initiatives, their view of how useful they found various FCM Program initiatives, and, the influence the FCM initiatives have had on certain actions taken or planned by their own municipalities.

The draft questionnaire was reviewed by three members of NAC: Janice Dembo, Coordinator, Toronto Mayor's Committee on Community and Race Relations; James Francois, a community representative from Dartmouth, Nova Scotia; and, Councillor Bev Salmon, Metro Toronto. The questionnaire was also sent to Ajit Mehat, Director, Race Relations and Cross-cultural Understanding, Multiculturalism and Citizenship Canada. Comments and input received from these four individuals were incorporated in the questionnaire and in the study design before the survey was sent out on May 4, 1990.

Appendix 1.1 contains a copy of the questionnaire.

78 questionnaires, 29. 6 % of the total, were returned. As two of these questionnaires arrived too late, results from 76 responses (28.8 % of the total) have been tabulated and presented in this report.

1.1.3 Case Studies

Case studies were conducted in six cities: Vancouver, Saskatoon, Winnipeg, Toronto, Montreal, and Halifax.

In each city, personal interviews were held with elected/appointed municipal government officials and individual/group meetings were held with community organizations and in three cities, with municipal race relations committees. Where it was not possible to meet with an individual, telephone interview was held.

1.2 REPORT CONTENTS

This report contains the following parts:

Executive Summary

Part 1: Introduction and Background
Part 2: Survey Findings
Part 3: Case Studies
Part 4: Conclusions and Recommendations

SPECIFIC ACTIONS PROPOSED

1. A review and re-definition of the objectives of FCM Race Relations Program and NAC including restructuring the membership.

2. A review of the staff requirements for the FCM Program with a view to increasing the staff complement.

3. Increasing contact and communication between NAC and FCM Board on a regular basis to sensitize the Board on race relations issues and to integrate race relations and multicultural dimensions in other activities and programs of FCM.

4. Holding a regional symposium in one of these locations: B.C., Prairie Provinces, or Northwestern Ontario.

5. Publication of information flyers on specific communities/ groups, e.g. Sikhs, Aboriginal Peoples, Women, Youth, Seniors.

6. Holding working sessions on at least two of these issues: employment equity and contract compliance, health, housing, parks and recreation. And, developing guidelines for municipal action based on these sessions.

7. Establish on-going liaison with major ethnocultural and racial minority organizations, e.g. CEC, CRAR, CRJ, UAC.

8. Initiate more effective direct advisory services to municipalities, especially medium and smaller-sized cities/towns.

9. Issue press releases on issues of concern as they arise to provide greater visibility to FCM program.

10. Prepare an inventory of local resource people to assist and guide municipalities locally.

11. Prepare "How To" manuals on youth employment program and institutional change in municipal bodies such as libraries.

12. Publish substantive articles on race relations issues in the FORUM.

13. Review operations and effectiveness of race relations committees and prepare guidelines for imprving effectiveness.

14. Provide guidelines and assistance to municipalities in holding events on March 21 with a view to ensure a greater municipal focus.

15. Co-sponsor a major event on March 21 at the national level in cooperation with CEC and AFN.

PART 2: SURVEY FINDINGS

2.1 Survey Recipients

The survey questionnaire was distributed by mail to 264 recipients selected on the following basis:

A 115 Municipalities:

In order to provide a reasonable regional balance, the following criteria were used:

i) Every municipality in Canada with a population of 35,000 or more provided the multicultural/multiracial (i.e. non-British/non-French) segment of its population was at least 10 % of the total population in that municipality.

The Statistics Canada data from the 1986 Census were used to determine whether a municipality met this criterion.

ii) All provincial/territorial capitals.

B 63 Visible Minority/Ethnic Community Organizations:
These organizations were selected from the list of delegates who attended the FCM 1989 National Symposium.

C 36 Municipal Race Relations Committees:

These were the total number of committees on the FCM list of municipal race relations committees.

D 50 Institutional Representatives:

They were selected from the list of delegates who attended the FCM 1989 National Symposium.

2.2 Survey Respondents

Of 264 survey questionnaire recipients, 78, or 29.6 % of the total returned their questionnaires. Two of these questionnaires were returned too late for inclusion in the analysis of survey results. Therefore, survey results are based on an analysis of responses from 76, or 28.8 % of the total recipients.

2.2.1 Respondents By Categories

As shown in Appendix 2/1, 53 municipalities out of 115 which received the questionnaire, returned the same. This amounts to a rate of return of 46.1 %.

The rates of return from community organizations, municipal race relations committees and institutional representatives were less than 15 %.

The low rates of return for community organizations and municipal race relations committees can be explained.

With regards to community organizations, a number of factors have led to a low rate of return. These include: changes in leadership in some of the community organizations; the voluntary nature of these organizations; and, the fact that input of many ethnic and visible minority community organizations was sought and received during field visits to conduct case studies.

As far as municipal race relations committees are concerned, in addition to four committees which returned their questionnaires, there were seven other respondents with double identity. Six of them represented municipal governments, but were also on their municipal committees; and one represented a community organization who was also on the municipal committee. Adding these seven to four committee respondents gives a total of 11 out 36 responses from municipal race relations committees, or a rate of return of 30.5 %.

Appendix 2/2 gives information and identities of respondents by categories.

2.2.2 Survey Respondents by Province

As indicated in Appendix 2/3, responses came from all regions of the country except from Prince Edward Island and the territories.

The largest number of responses, 36, or 47.4 % of the total, came from Ontario. The second largest number of responses were from British Columbia with 12 responses (15.8 % of total), followed by 10 (13.2 %) from Quebec, 7 (9.2 %) from Alberta, 5 (6.6 %) from Saskatchewan, 3 (4.0 %) from Nova Scotia, and 1 (1.3 %) each from Manitoba, New Brunswick, and Newfoundland.

What is interesting is that with the exception Alberta, the percentage distribution of respondents was closely similar to the distribution of recipients. This provides the survey results with a good regional balance.

2.3 SURVEY FINDINGS

Survey results are reported to correspond to various parts of the questionnaire.

2.3.1 Part I: Race/Ethnic Relations Programs, Policies and Plans

A Race/Ethnic Relations Committees

The survey provided information about 27 municipal race/community relations committees in Canada.

A typical municipal committee is an ongoing rather an ad hoc committee. It is comprised of 15 members: 2 elected municipal government representatives, 8 visible minority/ethnic community members, and 5 other members. Chaired by a community member, the typical committee does not have the services of a paid coordinator, and its annual budget is less than $15,000. The committee meets monthly, and its meetings are public.

Specific details are as follows:

Q.1 Number of Race/Ethnic Relations Committees:

27 committees were reported in the survey

These committees were reported by:

28	municipal government respondents
5	community organizations
5	municipal race relations
4	institutional representatives
41	total respondents

A number of these respondents were from the same municipalities (for example, Toronto and Montreal). Therefore, the actual number of committees reported was 27.

Q.2 Nature of Committees:

All but one committee are ongoing committees.

Q.3(a) Year of Formation:

18 of 27 committees, or two-third have been formed since 1984, the year in which FCM began its involvement in municipal race relations.

The oldest committee was formed in 1976, and as many as 7 committees have been established in 1990.

Q.3(b) Reasons for forming committees:

Municipal Initiative:	17 responses
Citizen Advocacy:	7 responses
FCM Manuals/Symposium:	4 responses
Specific Incident:	4 responses
Combination of Reasons:	9 responses
No answer:	35 responses
Total:	76 responses

14 out of 28 respondents from municipal governments indicated "municipal initiative" as a reason. This accounts for a much higher number of total responses showing "municipal initiative" as a reason compared to other reasons.

Q.4 Committee Type:

21 committees have a combination of council representatives, community members and institutional representatives.

Q.5 Committee Composition:

(a) Total members:

Between 5 - 35
Average: 15 members on each committee

(b) Elected Municipal Officials:

Between 0 - 6
Average: 2 elected officials on each committee

(c) Community Members:

Between 2- 28
Average: 8 community members on each committee

(d) Other Members:

Between 3 - 10
Average: 5 other members on each committee

(e) Committee Chair:

i)	Municipal Official:	8	comms.
ii)	Community Member:	14	
iii)	Another Member:	1	
iv)	Co-chair: Community Member/Municipal Official:	2	
v)	Co-chair: Another Member/ Municipal Official:	1	
vi)	No response:	1	
	Total:	27	

Q.6 Paid Coordinator for Committee: 7
No Coordinator 20
Total: 27 comms.

(a) Coordinator: Full-time: 5
Part-time: 2

(b) Coordinator paid by:
Mun. Govt: 5
Fed/Mun. 1
No answer: 1

Q.7 Budget: yes: 15
no: 12
Total: 27 committees

Amount:	Less than $5,000:	5	
	Bet.$5,000-15,000:	5	
	Bet.$15,000-25,000:	0	
	Bet.$25,000-50,000:	1	
	More than $50,000:	3	
	No answer:	1	

Q.8	Meetings:	Monthly:	21	
		Bi-monthly:	2	
		Quarterly:	2	
		Other times:	1	
		No answer:	1	
		Total:	27	committees

Q.9	Public Meetings:	yes:	14	
		no:	13	
		Total:	27	committees

Q.10	Sub-committees:	yes:	17	
		no:	8	
		no answer:	2	
		Total:	27	committees

Q.11 Committee Mandate:

The mandate of municipal race relations committees varies considerably. On the one hand, a number of committees have a detailed, very specific and comprehensive mandate. Examples include Toronto and Winnipeg. At the other extreme are those committees whose mandate is expressed very simply in a few general statements.

For example, the Terms of Reference of Toronto Mayor's Committee on Community and Race Relations has a very wide-ranging and comprehensive mandate. The general function of the committees is:

- To promote understanding and respect among racial,cultural, ethnic, religious and community groups in the city

- To seek solutions to problems concerning citizens of the City with a view toward providing an environment in which each citizen has equal opportunity to grow to his or her maximum potential

- To help combat racism and other activities which may lead to inter-group tension and conflict in the city

In addition, the Committee is also mandated to carrying out a number of a number of duties including: advising and consulting with City Council; working actively with the Metro Toronto Police Department, the Toronto Board of Education, and the neighbourhood committees; encouraging minority and other local groups to engage in programs to improve community relations; initiating and coordinating discussion between individuals and groups to reduce tensions; receiving and reviewing complaints of tension, prejudice, racism and discrimination; recommending programs to provide equal treatment and employment opportunities for visible and other minorities; recommending research by universities and other government agencies; and, reporting its findings and recommendations to the Council from time to time.

The Community and Race Relations Committee of the City of Winnipeg has a similarly elaborate mandate.

At the other end are those committees who have been given very general mandate expressed in a few simple statements. For example, the following is the mandate of a race relations committee in one city:

To promote and foster respect, understanding and cooperation amongst all citizens and respond to significant changes in the ethnic, racial and cultural composition of the community; provide leadership and set an example in the community through its policies and programs.

Then there are those committees, whose mandate includes a combination of specifics and generalities.

In absence of a very detailed study of the relationship between the nature of a committee's mandate and its effectiveness and accomplishments, it is not possible to determine what kind of mandate results in a successful committee. However, on the basis of survey responses, it is clear that, in general, committees which have had a definitive and comprehensive mandate are able to deal with a wide variety of issues compared to those committees whose mandate is expressed in very broad generalities.

Q.12 Accomplishments of Municipal Race Relations Committees:

Municipal Race Relations Committees have undertaken a wide spectrum of activities. Many of these activities overlap in terms of their objectives, but it is possible to group the accomplishments of municipal committees under the following headings:

1. Sensitization and awareness raising
2. Employment-related issues
3. Issues related to minority access to municipal services
4. Police-minority relations
5. Response to individual incidents of racial conflict
6. Advocacy
7. Promotion of anti-racist and cross-cultural training
8. Networking

Some examples of accomplishments listed by respondents to the survey are contained in Appendix 2/4.

Q.13 Committee Members sit on various municipal commissions and boards in 13 municipalities:

Municipal Grants Commissions:	3	mun.
Personnel/Hiring Boards:	6	
Parks/Recreation Committees:	6	
Public Works Allocations:	2	
Special Projects/Event Boards:	7	
Other Boards/Commissions:	6	
On none of these:	14	

(Total does not add up because in a number of municipalities, committee members sit on more than one committees/boards.)

Q.14 Committee Effectiveness:

Respondents were asked to rate the effectiveness of the committees in their municipalities in five specific areas:

i) sensitization about ethnic/race relations issues
ii) introduction of employment equity
iii) minority access to municipal services
iv) policing
v) media and public relations

Respondents were asked to indicate their opinion on a scale from 4 (very effective) to 1 (not effective).

Results are indicated in Appendix 2/5.

As shown in that Appendix, overall, 51.2 % of respondents who reported the existence of a race relations committee, indicated the effectiveness of their committees in the higher range (i.e. at 4 and 3 in the scale). 14.6 % placed the effectiveness of their committees as low (i.e. at 2 in the scale), and only 2.4 % of respondents answered that their committees were not effective. And, 31.7 % of the respondents did not answer these questions.

Q.15 Plans for Forming a Race/Ethnic Relations Committee:

As noted earlier 27 municipal race relations committees have been reported by the survey respondents. Of the remaining municipalities, only 4 indicated plans for establishing such a committee.

B Municipal Policy

Q.1 Race/ethnic relations policies were reported in 22 municipalities.

Q.2 Policy Year:

Race/Ethnic Relations policies in 14 out of 22 municipalities, or 63.6 % of the total have been developed since 1984, the year in which FCM first took initiatives in municipal race relations.

Q.3 Knowledge of Municipal Policy:

15 of the 22 municipalities with a policy, make their policies known to visible minority/ethnic communities, municipal workers, managers and to the community at large. In the remaining municipalities, there is no definite pattern as to who is the policy made known to. However, in four of these municipalities, visible minority/ethnic communities or the community at large are not made aware of the policy.

Q.4 Plans to Develop a Policy:

Of 31 municipalities without a policy, only 10 indicated any plans to develop a race/ethnic relations policy. Remaining 21 municipalities had no such plans.

C Community Outreach and Communication

Q.1 Outreach Programs:

20 of 53 municipal government respondents, or a little over one-third, indicated that they had an outreach program for Visible/Ethnic Minority communities.

An examination of the details of outreach programs, where respondents have included such details, indicates that there is a wide variety of approaches to community outreach undertaken by various municipalities.

Examples include: maintaining a contact list of community organizations; liaising with communities through race relations committees; mailing of all human resource advertisements to community organizations; specific library and health department programs; regular meetings with community leaders; police-minority workshops; summer programs for minority students; and activities undertaken in certain municipalities as part of another program (for example, outreach initiatives undertaken in the City of Toronto as part of THE YEAR FOR RACIAL HARMONY PROGRAM).

Q.2 Multicultural/Immigrant Services Centre:

33 of 53 municipalities in the survey reported having a multicultural/immigrant services centre in their municipalities.

Municipalities support these centres in a variety of ways. The most prevalent is financial support. 21 of 33 municipalities with a centre provide financial support to these centres. Other forms of support include: provision of building/space (1 municipality), staffing (6 municipalities), and materials and equipment (5 municipalities). 10 municipalities provide more than form of support.

Q.3-6) and 8) Other Community Outreach and Communication Activities

Municipalities report a number of other activities as part of their community outreach and communication initiatives:

i)	Maintaining lists of ethnic community organizations:	37 municipalities
ii)	Financial assistance to com. org:	25
iii)	Interpretation/trans. services:	17
iv)	Ads.in ethnic newsletters/papers:	23
v)	Municipal proclamations:	23
vi)	Sponsoring/publishing posters:	11
vii)	Support/sponsor ethnic exhibitions:	9
viii)	Street names to commemorate ethnic leaders/events/traditions:	6
ix)	Recognition awards:	5
x)	Creating civic symbols to acknowledge ethnic group/events:	5

Q.7 March 21: The International Day for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination:

An overwhelming number of municipalities in the survey, 41 out 53, or 77.4 %, participate in observing March 21.

The most common way of participating for municipalities is by a municipal proclamation. 37 municipalities proclaim March 21st. Ten municipalities organize events and six municipalities provide financial support to community groups observing March 21. A total of 20 municipalities participate in March 21 events through more than one of these activity.

D Access and Employment

Q.1 Access Programs:

25 municipalities indicated that they have programs to provide greater access to municipal services for Visible/Ethnic Minorities.

(a) Information on details of access programs provided by some respondents indicated, that for most of them, access program related only to employment in the municipal government. By far the majority of municipalities do not have programs to provide minority access to other services such as health, housing, and parks and recreation.

The following are a few examples of typical responses with regard to details on municipal access programs:

"Employment Equity".

"Re: employment - outreach recruitment."

"Part of Equal Opportunity Program."

"No formal process. Open door policy prevails.Selection of staff is based on ability."

"Focus on Employment Workshops. Fire Fighting Outreach."

"Equal Employment Opportunity Program."

(b) Involvement of Race Relations Committees:

In order to determine the extent of the involvement of race relations committees in municipal access programs, respondents were asked provide their answers on a descending scale from 4 (signifying that the committee was very involved) to 1 (signifying no involvement of the committee).

The results indicate that over one-third of the respondents felt that their committees had some degree of involvement (i.e. at 4, 3, or 2 in the scale). A little less than one-quarter of respondents felt that their committees were not involved in the access program, whereas, over forty percent of respondents did not answer this question.

Q.2 Survey of Visible Minorities and Aboriginal Peoples:

22 municipalities have conducted surveys of Visible Minorities and Aboriginal Peoples in their employment.

Q.3 Introduction of Employment Equity:

28 municipalities indicated that they have introduced employment equity programs.

A closer examination of responses as well as discussions with a number of municipal officials during field visit to conduct case studies, suggest that some municipalities are equating employment equity programs with equal opportunity programs.

While there are a few municipalities where these two kinds of programs mean the same thing, there are others where their employment equity programs do not contain goals and time tables required under an employment equity program.

Year of Introduction of Employment Equity:

Of 28 municipalities reporting employment equity (or equal employment opportunity) programs, 20 or 71.4 % report having introduced their programs since 1984, the year in which FCM began its initiatives in municipal race relations.

FCM's promotion efforts as well as the introduction of employment equity at the federal level in 1986 have contributed to such a large percentage of employment equity programs since 1984.

The pace of introduction of employment equity (equal employment opportunity) programs has accelerated in the last three years. Thus, 3 municipalities introduced employment equity in 1988, 5 in 1989, and 6 so far in 1990.

Q.4 Special consideration to Visible Minority and Aboriginal women:

Only 14 respondents replied that they give special consideration to Visible Minority and Aboriginal women.

As for the kind of special measures they may have taken, most of those respondents who answered in the affirmative, have given no details. And information from a few of the respondents who have given information, is fuzzy. It appears that some respondents have answered this question in the affirmative because women are a target group in their employment equity programs.

F Education and Training

Education and training are important means for improving race relations and implementing institutional change. Respondents were asked to indicate what kind of programs they have introduced/organized.

Q.1 Public Forums:

17 municipalities have organized or held public forums, workshops or conferences on race and ethnic relations. These 17 municipalities are also the ones which have race relations committees.

This is a clear indication of the influence of municipal race relations committees. Municipal committees have been instrumental and effective in having public forums organized in their municipalities.

Q.2 Cross-cultural or Race Relations Training:

21 municipalities, close to 40 % of the total number of municipal governments in the survey, answered that they conduct cross-cultural or race relations training for their staff and/or management.

Those respondents who responded positively to this question were asked to specify the kind of training their municipalities conduct, and the following are their responses:

i.	Sensitization/Awareness Training:	16 mun.
ii.	Anti-racist Education:	10
iii.	Human Rights Training:	13
iv.	Cross-cultural Communication:	12
v.	Managing Diversity:	12
vi.	Serving a Diverse Community:	12
vii.	General Information Sessions:	13
	More than one kind of training:	17

Survey results on training are indicative of an area in which FCM efforts need to be focused on.

2.3.2 Part II: FCM Race Relations Program and Initiatives

Part II of the survey questionnaire was designed to obtain respondents' input specifically with respect to the FCM Race Relations Program Initiatives.

Respondents were asked three specific questions:

i) their familiarity with the FCM Race Relations Program

ii) the usefulness of FCM Race Relations initiatives

iii) the influence of the FCM Program on specific actions within their own municipalities.

In interpreting the results of this part of the survey, it is important to bear in mind that these responses are not precise measurements. They are based on the respondents' own interpretation of the questions and their perception of the FCM Program, its usefulness and influence.

Q.1 Familiarity with the FCM Program:

Survey respondents were asked to indicate their familiarity with the FCM Race Relations Program and Initiatives on a scale: Yes___ Somewhat___ Very Little___ No___

All respondents who checked "yes", "somewhat", or "very little" are considered to have had some degree of familiarity with the FCM program. On the other hand, respondents who checked "no" are considered to have had no familiarity with the FCM program.

Results show that over four-fifths of respondents - 82.9 % to be exact - indicated some degree of familiarity with the FCM Program.

The overall pattern of answers between municipal government and other respondents (i.e. race relation committees, community organizations and institutions) was very similar. Thus

83.9 % of municipal government respondents as compared to 80.0 % of other respondents indicated some degree of familiarity with the FCM program (see Appendix 2/6).

Q.2 Usefulness of FCM's Program /Initiatives:

Respondents were asked to indicate the usefulness of six FCM initiatives (e.g. "How To" manuals, March 1989 National Symposium, etc.) on a descending scale: 4, 3, 2, and 1, where number 4 signified "very useful" and number 1 signified "not useful".

As indicated in Appendix 2/7, 42.1 % of all respondents, on average, found some degree of usefulness in FCM program initiatives as compared to only 9.2 % who did not find FCM initiatives useful. And, 48.7 % of respondents did not answer questions on usefulness.

Details with respect to each FCM initiative are as follows:

a) <u>"How To" Manuals</u>

The "How To" manuals are considered by far the most useful of FCM initiatives. Each of the first two manuals, "Getting Started," and, "Dealing with Diversity," are found useful by 51.3 % of all respondents. Only 6.6 % of respondents do not find these manuals useful.

b) <u>March 1989 National Symposium</u>

The March 1989 National Symposium is considered useful by over 47.5 % of all respondents.

c) <u>Forum and News Items</u>

The FCM Forum articles and news items on race/ethnic relations matters are found useful by 48.7 % of all survey respondents.

d) & f) FCM Race Relations Office and March 21 Promotion

Contact with and communication from the FCM Race Relations office and FCM's promotion of March 21 are each considered useful by 42.1 % of respondents.

e) National Action Committee

32.8 % of respondents consider contact and communication from the National Action Committee as useful.

There are marked differences between the responses of municipal and "Other" respondents. The greatest difference in their views about usefulness is in respect of the March 1989 National Symposium. Only 41.1 % of municipal government representatives considered this initiative as useful as compared to 65.0 % of "Other respondents". Somewhat smaller, but noticeable differences prevail on other initiatives.

Q.3 **Influence of the FCM Race Relations Program:**

Respondents were asked to indicate the influence of the FCM Program on certain actions taken or planned by their own municipality (e.g. race relations committee, race/ethnic relations policy, etc.) on a descending scale: 4,3,2,and 1, where number 4 signified strong influence, and number 1 signified no influence.

As indicated in Appendix 2/8, for the 9 questions asked, on average, 45.0 % of respondents did not answer questions on FCM program's influence.

27.1 % of respondents indicated that the FCM Program had some degree of influence on their own municipal initiatives. This is about the same percentage as those respondents who answered that the Program had no influence (i.e.27.9 %).

The March 21 events are seen as having been influenced the most by FCM's Program. Almost one-third of all respondents indicated that the FCM Program had some degree of influence on March 21st events in their municipalities.

In contrast, only 17.1 % of respondents saw any influence of FCM's Program on the police-minority relations program in their municipality.

There are differences in responses between municipal governments and "Other" respondents. Except for police-minority relations and organizing of workshops/seminars/conferences, a greater percentage of "Other" respondents consistently indicated some degree of influence of the FCM Program on their municipal initiatives as compared to respondents from municipal governments.

Q.4 & 5 Suggestions for FCM

These questions asked respondents to provide any suggestions they might have for the FCM for improving its current initiatives and for initiating new activities.

A number of suggestions have been received. These deal with such matters as: regional presence of the FCM; special consideration for the concerns of women, youth and seniors; sensitizing of City Council members and top managers; sharing of information and models of successful initiatives; and others.

Examples of these suggestions are listed in Appendix 2/9.

2.4 Analysis of Survey Results

2.4.1 Municipal Race Relations Initiatives

There is ample evidence to indicate that a great deal of activity in race relations has taken place in Canadian municipalities since 1984 when the FCM first began its involvement.

Measures taken by municipalities vary widely. As well, there is a lot of room for improvement. There are still many municipalities which have not taken much initiative; and, among those which have undertaken some measures, there are a number of municipalities which have not given high enough priority to race relations. Indeed, many municipalities have allotted very little human and financial resources to their race relations initiatives.

Furthermore, many of the municipal programs are still very recent. These municipalities have barely begun their race relations programs. It is too early to evaluate their effectiveness.

Nevertheless, the survey results indicate a need for much greater effort in the following areas:

i Race/community relations committees, their mandate, and resources allotted to them.

ii Employment equity/contract compliance programs with goals and time tables.

iii Development of initiatives to improve access to municipal services and institutions.

iv Race relations and cross-cultural training.

2.4.2 Respondents' Views About the FCM Race Relations Program

The fact that 82.9 % of survey respondents indicated some degree of familiarity with the FCM Race Relations Program is positive. Yet, only less than 50 % of the respondents considered FCM initiatives as useful, and only a little more than one-quarter of respondents felt that the FCM Program has had some degree of influence on their own municipal initiatives.

Thus, there is a dichotomy. On the one hand, there has been a significant increase in municipal and FCM race relations initiatives; but on the other hand, the usefulness and influence of the FCM Program appear to be weak. This dichotomy is explained by the context within which the FCM Race Relations Program functions.

2.5 The Context

The FCM Race Relations Program functions within the context of a number of factors. These factors are both external and internal to the FCM Program.

External factors include:

Demographics: The Canadian population is changing rapidly in its cultural and racial composition. The birth and fertility rates in Canada are among the lowest in the world and this trend is expected to continue.

Immigration patterns have changed dramatically in the last 25 years, and as a result, the bulk of newcomers to Canada are from the Third World countries of Asia, Africa, the Caribbean, and Latin and South America. In 1988, for example, over 70 % of immigrants to Canada came from these countries.

This has resulted in noticeable increases of members of Visible Minorities in Canada. According to the 1986 Census, Visible Minorities were 6.3 % of Canada's population. This segment of our population is expected to reach approximately 10 % by the year 2000.

Perhaps more significant for municipalities is the fact that over three-quarters of the members of Visible Minorities are concentrated in urban metropolitan areas of the country.

Institutional Change in Municipalities: The process of lasting institutional change is slow. Results cannot be expected within a few years. This is particularly true of institutions like municipal governments. They are among the oldest institutions with a history of organizational structures and procedures. With a few exceptions, they do not change easily and quickly.

Dynamics of Local Racial Minority Communities: There are hundreds of organizations catering to the needs of racial minority communities throughout Canada. Depending on their numbers and the nature of their concerns, these organizations differ significantly in their approaches to race relations issues.

Leadership: Leadership of both the municipal officials and the racial minority communities plays an important part in determining the municipal approach to race relations and its effectiveness.

Economic Conditions: Economic conditions have a significant impact on race relations. In times of economic downturn, the prospects of tensions in race relations are much greater as compared to a period of economic upswing.

National and International Trends and Events: A number of indicators suggest that intolerance of racial minorities in Canada is increasing.

Both the Angus Reid-Southam poll (published in February, 1990) and the Environics Research Group poll (published in June, 1990) reported an increase in racism and bigotry in Canada.

The debate on the Meech Lake accord aroused passions of many Canadians that often verged on racism, and the crisis at Oka is a manifestation of perhaps the most crucial race relations issue in Canada today - the rights and the plight of the Aboriginal Peoples.

Indicators of prevailing racism can be found almost on a daily basis in many walks of life: employment, policing, the justice system, housing, education, the media.

Blatant manifestations of the prevailing climate include: incidents of vandalism, desecration of cemeteries, racist graffiti, and the spread of hate literature and materials; the backlash generated by increasing numbers of immigrants generally, and particularly entrepreneurial immigrants from Hong Kong; and, the controversy around the issue of allowing Sikhs to wear turbans as part of the RCMP uniform.

Canada is not the only country in which racial intolerance is on a rise. Similar trends are reported in the United States (as depicted in June, 1990, by a CBS television program "48 Hours"), France (as described in the Globe and Mail dated April 7, 1990 and TIME Magazine dated April 16, 1990), and other countries.

Internal factors which impact on the FCM Program are:

FCM's Mandate and Mission: FCM is an organization o f organizations. As a federation, it cannot compel its member municipalities into undertaking a particular program or action. It can only encourage, support and attempt to persuade its members.

Resource Availability: In view of the limitations of FCM's own resources, its Race Relations Program has to be carried out within the constraints of resources available from outside sources, primarily Multiculturalism and Citizenship Canada.

Taking all of the above factors into account, there is no doubt about the increase in municipal race relations activities since 1984 when FCM began its initiatives. There is also no question that FCM is getting its message out. But, because of the context within which the FCM Program functions, its usefulness and influence are not readily discernible.

PART 3: CASE STUDIES

3.1 GENERAL

In accordance with the terms of reference for the project, case studies were conducted in six cities: Vancouver, Saskatoon, Winnipeg, Toronto, Montreal and Halifax.

The selection of these cities was based on the following criteria:

- two municipalities which are very active in race relations;
- two municipalities which have recently begun to address race relations at the municipal level;
- two municipalities which are inactive, but by virtue of their ethnic and racial composition, should be more involved;
- municipalities which provide a regional balance; and,
- a mix of large urban and smaller municipalities.

In each city, personal interviews were held with municipal government officials, and individual/group meetings were held with community organizations. Meetings were held with municipal race relations committees in Vancouver, Saskatoon and Winnipeg. As well, key elected municipal officials were interviewed either in person or by telephone in Halifax, Vancouver, and Toronto.

Meetings with municipal officials were organized by or through contact people in each city. Generally, contact people were coordinators and/or chairs of municipal race/community relations committees, or an employment equity officer/ coordinator, or a person from the Mayor's office.

Meetings with community members were organized in each city by community leaders who were approached in advance of field work visits.

During interviews and meetings, participants were asked about their views on race relations issues in their municipalities, and about actions already undertaken by their municipalities in dealing with the issues. Information was also sought from participants on two specific questions related to FCM: whether they were familiar with the FCM Race Relations Program; and, what suggestions they might have about the role FCM could play in improving race relations in their municipalities. Depending on the position of the participants (i.e. municipal officials as compared to a community representative), specific questions and discussions with them varied.

3.1.1 RACE RELATIONS ISSUES - AN OVERVIEW

While every city is unique in terms of the composition of

its population, race relations history and the development of its municipal race relations program, there are a number of basic issues common to all six cities. These issues are:

1. Employment within Municipal Government Services
2. Policing and Enforcement of Law and Order
3. Spread of Vandalism, Graffiti, Racist Pins, Buttons and Hate Literature
4. Effective Communication with Racial/Ethnic Minority Communities
5. Access to Municipal Services and Institutions
6. Commitment of Elected/Appointed Municipal Officials

It must be noted that the extent of concerns with each one of the above issues varies from one city to another. And, there are other issues specific to a particular city. Nevertheless, concerns about the above issues are generally common to every city under study. A thumbnail description of each issue follows.

1. Employment

Representation of Visible Minorities and Aboriginal Peoples in municipal services in the six cities continues to be below their representation in the labour force.

All six cities have introduced employment equity (or equal employment opportunity) programs. However, in Montreal, the program was introduced only in 1989; and, in Halifax, in early 1990. Therefore, it is too early for these cities to experience any noticeable progress.

Other cities have had employment equity programs for some years. Of these cities, the City of Toronto has reported the most noticeable improvement. As for other cities, either the progress is slow or the relevant information is not available to assess progress.

As a result, the general concern about a lack of adequate minority representation in municipal governments especially at senior management levels remains one of the most important race relations issues.

2. Policing and Enforcement of Law and Order

The problem in policing is two-fold: the police forces' lack of sensitivity and understanding of racial minorities, and, an inadequate number of minorities in police forces.

Increasing efforts and resources are being devoted to sensitizing and training police officers and to hiring minorities. Progress is far from satisfactory.

Furthermore, investigations like the Donald Marshall Inquiry in Halifax and the Harper Inquiry in Winnipeg have shown insensitivity and discriminatory practices even in the justice system and the enforcement of law and order.

3. Spread of Vandalism, Graffiti, Racist Pins, Buttons and Hate Literature

Racial minorities in all six cities expressed concerns about the emergence of white supremacist groups like the Aryan Nations Organization and other racist groups. Desecration of Jewish cemeteries, vandalism of synagogues and painting of racist graffiti by these groups have been accompanied by activities of other individuals and racist groups. Examples of these activities are: production and distribution of hate literature, racist buttons, pins and pamphlets.

These activities of racist groups have assumed added significance in view of the manifestations of racial attitudes brought to the surface by the backlash against Asian immigrants and against the decision to allow Sikhs to wear turbans in the RCMP.

4. Effective Communication with Racial/Ethnic Minority Communities

Inadequate or a lack of communication between the municipality and community organizations has been identified as a major problem. One concern here is that often, those community members who are routinely contacted by municipal officials or who are on municipal committees, do not represent or are not accountable to their communities. Another concern stems from the perception of many community members that by having their representatives on a City Hall committee, they have been co-opted in supporting municipal race relations practices and policies.

5. Access to Municipal Services and Institutions

Barriers to minority access to municipal services exist in all six cities. These barriers are created by a number of factors: communication difficulties created by different languages; a lack of understanding of and empathy for racial minorities' needs; and, inadequate representation of racial communities in and among the personnel and policy makers.

6. Commitment of Elected/Appointed Municipal Officials

Questions about the commitment of elected and/or appointed municipal officials have been raised in every one of the six cities. To be sure, most of the concerns are directed at

elected municipal councils and appointed senior City Hall bureaucrats. It appears that even with a highly committed Mayor, a municipality cannot succeed in implementing an effective race relations program without the commitment and support of the city council and the senior city managers.

3.1.2. REPORTING OF CASE STUDIES

Findings of the case studies have been related to the six issues identified above although the order in which they are reported varies from one city to another.

On each of these issues, actions taken by the six cities have been recorded along with results achieved through such municipal initiatives where it was possible to do so. An issue unique to one of these cities has been discussed and municipal actions to deal with such an issue, if any, have been reported.

Before proceeding further, caution with respect to the case studies is in order. These case studies do not present a complete and comprehensive examination of race relations in the six cities. Race relations issues are so complex and multi-dimensional that the limited field work conducted for these studies can provide but a glimpse at the municipal race relations scene.

Furthermore, identification of issues and information on municipal initiatives were very much dependent on the interviews and meetings held with a limited number of people in each city. The scope and the size of the project simply did not allow for an in-depth, scientific study.

3.2 VANCOUVER

The largest racial minority community in Vancouver consists of over 100,000 people of Chinese origin. Vancouver also has the highest concentration of people of South Asian origin in Canada, especially Sikhs, who first migrated to Canada in the early 1900's.

Overall, Visible Minorities in Vancouver numbered 230,840, or 16.9 % of City's total population of close to 1.4 million, according to the 1986 Census. Those of East and Southeast Asian origin were the largest group with over 152,000 people. The second largest were people of South Asian origin (close to 52,000), followed by Aboriginal Peoples (32,000) and Blacks (over 7,500). With increasing numbers of refugees from Latin and South America, the City's multicultural/ multiracial collage is assuming another important dimension.

3.2.1 RACE RELATIONS ISSUES AND MUNICIPAL ACTIONS

Race relations issues of concern racial communities and municipal officials in Vancouver are:

1. **Racist Graffiti, Hate Literature and Racist Propaganda**

Increasing spread of racist graffiti, hate literature and racist propaganda in Vancouver has coincided with the backlash against Asian, especially Chinese immigrants from Hong Kong.

In particular, skyrocketing real estate prices in Vancouver have been attributed by some local residents to the fact that more and more Hong Kong Chinese are coming to Vancouver with huge investments in the wake of the scheduled change in Hong Kong's status in 1997 when the colony reverts to Chinese sovereignty. Supported by extensive media coverage, this issue has brought out a lot of racist stereotypes and prejudice.

At about the same time, Vancouver saw the emergence of white supremacist and other racist groups which preach racial hatred, advocate violence, collect weapons, desecrate synagogues, churches, temples and cemeteries with racist graffiti, and infiltrate schools to recruit young people.

The Special Council Committee on Race Relations has studied the matter and made some far-reaching recommendations for actions by the Vancouver City Council.

These recommendations include: action by the Council to publicly and expressly commit itself to the elimination of racism in any form in the City of Vancouver; examining and amending the

City by-laws to include harsher penalties for racist graffiti and/or creating new by-laws aimed at halting the spread of racism; lobbying for the creation of a Hate Propaganda and Racial Harassment Unit at the Provincial level to coordinate efforts on this matter; and, lobbying for changes to the Criminal Code to make it easier to prosecute the perpetrators of hate propaganda.

The report was unanimously carried by the City Council. Specific actions recommended by the Committee are expected to be considered this fall.

2. Police-Minority Relations

Insensitivity of the police force and their lack of empathy towards racial minorities has been an issue in Vancouver for many years. The roots of police-minority tensions are deep, and they go back to the basic lack of understanding, stereotyping and prejudice about racial minority communities and their cultural and religious traditions.

Today, members of Black and Sikh communities are concerned about harassment and inattention by police to their complaints. The Southeast Asian and Aboriginal communities are concerned about police treatment based on stereotypes and a lack of empathy.

To deal with these problems, the Vancouver Police Department has taken a number of measures in the last few years. These include: i) community outreach, ii) hiring of racial minorities in the police force, and, iii) training and education.

i) Community Outreach

As part of its community outreach initiatives, the Vancouver Police Department has appointed an Inspector in its Community Relations Division who is responsible for ethnic relations and liaison. Within this division, there are also liaison units specifically to network with the Chinese, Indo-Canadian and Native communities.

An example of the Vancouver Police's Community Outreach Program is the holding of a session during Squad Development Days to focus on one of the racial/ethnic groups in Vancouver. During such a session, information is provided about the culture, traditions and history of the group by a member of that racial community.

ii) Hiring of Racial Minorities

In the last few years, the Vancouver Police Department has

placed increasing emphasis on the hiring of racial minorities. Supported by its community outreach initiatives, its efforts to hire more racial minorities are slowly, but surely, producing favourable results. At the end of 1989, there were a total of 33 police officers from Visible Minorities, 3.1 % of the total force of 1,051.

iii) Training and Education

With the assistance of the federal Department of the Secretary of State, Vancouver Police embarked on an intercultural training program in the fall of 1984. The program originally consisted of a three-day session, (subsequently reduced to a two-day session in 1989-90), in which both police officers and representatives from various ethnic communities participated. Its objectives were to increase interaction and understanding between the police and the community, improve police officers' awareness and cross-cultural sensitivity, and to promote the use of community resources.

The program was conducted in four distinct phases agreed to by the Police Department and the Committee for Racial Justice. With the completion of Phase IV of the program in January, 1990, all members of the police force and approximately 425 community members have gone through the program.

3. Employment in Municipal Government

The City of Vancouver first initiated its program on employment in 1978 when it hired a consultant to study the issue of equal employment opportunities. At that time, the focus was on employment of women. From that beginning, a full-fledged equal employment function was established in the Personnel Department in 1982. This was also the year when the Special Council Committee on Race Relations was formed. These developments resulted in increasing attention to employment of racial minorities.

Since 1986, when the equal employment office was moved out of the Personnel Department to the City Manager's Office, the Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Program of the City of Vancouver has been involved in a wide range of matters including: i) recruitment, ii) community outreach and consultation, and, iii) training.

i) Recruitment: The EEO office works closely with the Personnel Department to ensure that all job postings are made available to the community. A total of 154 organizations receive job postings on a weekly basis.

The EEO Office also holds information sessions with community organizations on a regular basis to explain to them the

City's recruitment process. Since 1986, the City has implemented a tracking system to determine whether the City's workforce is representative of the community. Participation of employees in the tracking system is voluntary. They are given a tracking form with the application form.

In addition to the tracking system, most City departments, on an ongoing basis, assess and evaluate the labour pool and report back to EEO.

The EEO program does not contain a system of goals and time table as in an employment equity program. And, information on employment of racial minorities in the municipal government is not available. This does not allow for an assessment of Vancouver's equal employment opportunity program.

ii) Community Outreach: As part of its outreach activities, the EEO office staff are regularly required to speak at conferences, to Boards of Directors, to community groups, to government departments, businesses and staff from other municipalities about various aspects of achieving a representative workforce at the municipal level.

To provide information about work in specific City departments, the EEO office holds information meetings with community organizations and other related agencies. Examples include: sessions about becoming firefighters and police officers; sessions held each spring for employment counsellors of the targeted groups to explain the recruiting process for auxiliary summer employment.

iii) Training: This is a key area of the EEO office's involvement. The office spends considerable time and resources in developing, delivering, and making available appropriate training and education programs for City staff. The EEO program fulfils this mandate through the Hastings Institute.

Created in September, 1989, as a private corporation wholly owned by the City of Vancouver, the Hastings Institute received initial funding from the Ministry of Multiculturalism and Citizenship. The goals of the Institute are:

- to enhance employment equity for the four target groups
- to improve race relations in the community and workplace
- to improve access to services

To achieve these goals, the Institute offers multicultural and employment equity training to the public and private sectors, and to non-profit and voluntary organizations.

The most important component of training offered by the Hastings Institute and by the EEO program earlier, is the Kingswood Management Training Program. This program is named after and modelled on the one originally developed by Metro

Toronto. It is designed to train managers and administrators in the techniques and skills of implementing equity in personnel management in the overall context of multiculturalism, race relations and employment equity. Participants are also introduced to strategies which will enhance public access to City services.

Since 1987, 75 City managers and another 75 managers from other organizations have gone through this program.

Other training initiatives include: "Manage from Strength: Yours," a program targeted to women and visible minorities in or aspiring to middle-management; English as a Second Language; the Native Mentoring Program; and, workshops held by the City Park Board and the Engineering Department.

4. Access to Municipal Services

The City of Vancouver has initiated a number of measures to meet the challenge of providing culturally-appropriate municipal services to the City's multicultural/multiracial communities.

The Vancouver Health Department presents a good example. Begun in 1982, the objectives of the Health Department program are:

- to increase participation of minority groups in the Health Department's programs thus reflecting their share of the total population

- to increase the employment of qualified staff from minority cultures to comply with the City's hiring policy.

Following consultation with the Race Relations Committee, and a series of training sessions for senior staff, a new position of Multicultural Health Educator was created. The incumbent is charged with the responsibilities of staff and community education, including coordination of the Department's translation policies.

Decision making and hiring were decentralized, so that each of the four Health Unit Directors was made responsible for his/her own staffing including a review of cultural and language issues. One of the biggest barriers in minority access to municipal health services is that of language. To deal effectively with the language issue, the Health Department has taken a number of steps. These include the following:

A. The Unit Directors were given authority to set up a "language designated" position where it was deemed necessary to provide departmental services in a language other than English. And, an agreement was negotiated with the two unions to pay a bonus to qualified staff whose language skills are tested and

certified. Under this agreement approximately 50 staff of the Department receive $90 per month language bonus.

B. Another measure was to increase the number of multilingual staff within the Department. Today, the Health Department employs 156 people who speak 39 languages. In addition, the department has access to a volunteer or contract interpretation service.

C. The department also invested in a set of MIGS (Medical Information Gathering System), which is available in 25 languages. The department acts as a resource to hospitals and other health agencies in the use of the MIGS.

Other culturally sensitive health programs followed the deliberations and recommendations of the 1989 Multicultural Health Symposium sponsored by the Department. The Department now offers the following programs for its multicultural clientele:

i) The Healthiest Babies Possible Program: This program assists high-risk pregnant women. Special attention is given to the Punjabi, Vietnamese, Native, and Central American communities among whom the occurrence of low birth weight is as high as 7.5 % (as compared to 4 % in the normally healthy group). The program has a multilingual professional and support staff and has a language capacity in several languages including English, French, Cantonese, Mandarin, Hindi, Punjabi, Spanish, Vietnamese, and Cambodian.

ii) Prenatal Classes in Vietnamese, Spanish, Cantonese and Punjabi: These classes are conducted by nurses who are of the appropriate culture and who speak the respective language fluently.

iii) Clinics: Basic primary health clinics are operated for those groups who are at risk due to lifestyle, tradition, etc. At present, emphasis is on the Vietnamese, Native, Latin American and the "street" people. Clinics are located in appropriate neighbourhoods.

iv) Travel Clinics: Multilingual staff operate a travel immunization service in all locations.

v) Adult Health Education: An adult health education and promotion service is operated in health units for people in mainstream as well as ethnic groups. The service is offered in a multilingual format.

vi) Community Relations: Senior department staff work with all committees or subcommittees of the City Council, and liaise with major immigrant-serving and ethnic organizations.

vii) Volunteer Service: Comprised of approximately 2,000 people, this service enables members of ethnic and racial groups to improve their language skills, support members of their own

community, and make health services available to the needy who otherwise may be deprived of the same.

viii) Tours for Recent Immigrants: The Department hosts these tours to explain its services to recent immigrants.

Another example of special measures taken by the City of Vancouver in improving minority access is the Strathcona Local Area Planning Program, a program being implemented by the Planning Department.

This is a program to develop the inner city area inhabited primarily by members of the Chinese, Cambodian and Latin American groups.

Social planners from the department found that the traditional Local Area Planning (LAP) model did not lend itself to securing input from large numbers of these people who, by reason of language or cultural differences are not comfortable in meetings or are unfamiliar with the community planning processes. Very few of these people were showing up at meetings organized to discuss plans. This, in turn, meant that extra time and effort by City staff was needed to enlist them in the process.

Based on the recommendations of its social planners, the multi-ethnic make-up of Strathcona has been recognized in both the terms of reference of the project and the processes adopted in conducting the project. A few of the changes introduced are: a dual-committee approach, one operating in English and the other in Cantonese; scheduling of meetings at times which are preferred by the community members rather than by the department; and, the adoption of a consensus approach to develop common ground in the community when making decisions.

5. Communication with Racial Communities

One of the first initiatives of the City of Vancouver was to establish, in 1982, the Special Council Committee on Race Relations. Comprised of 15 members including 12 Visible Minority/ethnic community members, 1 elected municipal government representative and 3 other members, the Committee is chaired by a community member.

Committee members are appointed on a rotating basis from a list of persons recommended by community groups by the City Council for a three-year term.

This system of rotating the terms of its members gives the committee stability in its work. It also gives the benefit of fresh ideas by opening doors to new members every year.

Over the years, the Race Relations Committee has been involved in a number of activities in the areas of public

education and advocacy. It acts as a mediator in matters thatmay affect a particular racial minority group. And, one important area of the Committee's work involves liaising with and providing networking links to various City Departments.

Through its sub-committees, the Race Relations Committee deals with such matters as: employment equity, health issues, ethnic/police liaison, and the media. The Committee also establishes Task Forces on specific areas of concern.

6. Commitment of Elected/Appointed Municipal Officials

Questions regarding the commitment of elected and appointed officials are not raised directly. But, it has been pointed out that the City has not appointed a full-time staff person to coordinate the work of the Race Relations Committee. As well, as pointed out by a community representative, the City's Equal Employment Opportunity Program has not made much difference in the hiring of racial minorities because the program does not have a built-in system of goals and time-tables. These facts were raised in discussions related to the commitment of the City.

3.2.2. FCM

Knowledge of and familiarity with FCM and its activities has been limited to those people who are involved with some parts of FCM's work. This is particularly true of people at the City Hall.

As far as minority community members are concerned, some of them have heard of FCM, and a few are familiar with FCM's work. But the majority of community members have very little knowledge of the FCM Program.

Suggestions for FCM's Program ranged from regional networking (for example, for municipalities in the Greater Vancouver District), to sensitization of the members of the City Council.

3.2.3 IN CLOSING....

In some ways, Vancouver is in a situation which is similar to that of Toronto when it comes to race relations. Like Toronto, Vancouver initiated its measures on race relations well before the launching of the FCM Program. Therefore, like Toronto, the City of Vancouver has accumulated experience and expertise in various aspects of race relations.

A few representatives from the Vancouver City Council as well as racial minority communities have been participating in the FCM National Action Committee. City officials find FCM publications and "How To" manuals very useful in their own work

on race relations. Thus, FCM is an effective forum for sharing of ideas and experiences.

At the same time, there are a number of initiatives underway in Vancouver (for example, the development of the Hastings Institute, proposed actions to combat the spread of racist graffiti and racist propaganda, and the initiatives taken by the Health Department) which could provide useful lessons to other cities through FCM.

3.3 SASKATOON

The largest single racial community in Saskatoon consists of the Aboriginal Peoples. According to Statistics Canada, there were well over 10,000 persons of Aboriginal ancestry in Saskatoon in 1986.

Other racial communities include over 5,000 persons with an origin in Southeast Asia, some 1,300 people of origin in South Asia, and about 1,000 people of Jewish faith.

3.3.1 RACE RELATIONS ISSUES AND MUNICIPAL ACTIONS

The most significant race relations issue in Saskatoon relates to the Aboriginal Peoples.

Historically, they have been the poorest people at the low end of socio-economic scale. Misunderstanding and misconception about their culture and tradition are rampant. This leads to not only subtle, but often blatant manifestations of racism, discrimination and prejudice. Whether it is police-minority relations, the work place or the education system, stereotypes about Aboriginal Peoples prevent them from full participation in institutions at all levels.

Within the framework of native issues, a number of other matters have added important dimensions to race relations issues in Saskatoon.

1. Vandalism, Desecration of Cemeteries and Hate Propaganda

A critical current race relations issue is that of vandalism, the desecration of Jewish synagogues and schools, and spread of hate propaganda. With the emergence of the Aryan Nations organization, incidents of vandalism have increased. These incidents have sensitized the Jewish community which is comprised of economically well settled professionals and business people. With hate-promoting activities directed at them, the community has begun organizing itself.

While the Jewish community and its synagogues and schools might be the immediate targets of white supremacist groups, other racial minorities in the city are equally concerned about the activities of these racist groups. A "Citizens Against Racism" (CAR) group has been formed. A number of religious and ethnic groups are represented in this group.

2. Employment in Municipal Government

The Aboriginal community has traditionally been an outsider when it comes to participating in the municipal government. Their relatively lower levels of education and training have kept them out of employment in the City and other institutions. Other racial minorities have not fared any better when it comes to employment with the municipality.

To deal with issues of employment, the City of Saskatoon introduced its Affirmative Action Program in 1987. Included as target groups in this program are women, Aboriginal Peoples and persons with disabilities. The Saskatchewan Human Rights Act does not include Visible Minorities as a target group, and therefore, Saskatoon's Affirmative Action Program also excludes them from its coverage. This is an issue of significant concern to the City's Visible Minority communities.

In the three years since the Affirmative Action Program was introduced, 89 Aboriginal persons have been hired or promoted. In the year 1989, with the hiring of 37 Aboriginal persons, the City achieved only 73 % of its goal for hiring and promotion of Aboriginal Peoples. And, most of these appointments have been in temporary or seasonal positions. Only 6 of these 37 positions were for permanent jobs and almost 50 % of the placements were in the labourer class.

A major problem encountered by the City in hiring and promotion of Aboriginal Peoples is their lack of training and education needed to perform the duties of available jobs. This accounts for a vast majority of native appointments in low-paying, unskilled jobs, many of which are seasonal and temporary.

In order to provide employment opportunities to people who do not have the requisite educational qualifications, the City of Saskatoon has worked out an equivalency testing scheme. Since 1988, the City has had procedures for measuring equivalent skills which could be gained normally through graduation from a business college. The testing is undertaken at a local business college and is comprised of the following subjects: spelling, word processing, dictaphone, shorthand, and typing.

The tests used are identical to the ones used for students in the business college programs and the scoring method and passing marks are the same as well. Once an applicant successfully completes the equivalency testing, she/he will be considered to have qualifications equivalent to those who graduate from the business college program.

Under this scheme, 11 people were tested in 1989, 1 of whom was a successful candidate for a position.

A number of other measures have been taken by the City to meet the goals of its Affirmative Actions program. These include:

- posting, in City Hall, the selection process with an explanation of the structure of the selection board, the interview, and the criteria used for making the employment decision
- making available internal application forms in all outside departments
- appointing an employment officer specifically to outreach target group members
- opening a 24-hour phone line to provide information regarding job postings
- providing the names of the selection board members to candidates before conducting interviews.

3. Communication and Outreach with Racial Minority Communities

To improve communication and outreach with the community, the Saskatoon City Council established, in the fall of 1989, a Race Relations Committee with the following objectives:

- to propose short and long term strategies to minimize racial tension and promote racial harmony
- to review policies, practices and programs of the City in order to recommend amendments and /or new action with respect to the activities of various City departments including personnel, law enforcement, public health, planning and housing and community services
- to develop a network with other organizations and agencies who have similar objectives
- to receive, review and refer complaints of racial discrimination, acts of prejudice, racism and discriminatory practices within the city or from citizens with respect to municipal staff and activities

The Committee is composed of members from Visible Minority and Aboriginal Peoples' organizations as well as representatives from institutions like school boards and the police department. Up to 2 elected aldermen also sit on the Committee. In accordance with City Council direction, at least 50 % of the Committee's membership must come from representatives of Visible Minorities. The Committee is chaired by a community representative.

Since its establishment last fall, the Race Relations Committee has carried out a number of activities including: inviting representatives of racial communities to brief the members on their concerns; hearing from the Canadian and Saskatchewan Human Rights Commissions; making presentations to the Saskatchewan Task Force on Multiculturalism; and, receiving reports of the activities of a few municipal departments.

Recently, the Committee also sponsored a play by a Nigerian author dealing with the South African situation and followed this up with a discussion on "Creative Responses to Racism".

As the Committee is relatively new, it is too early to evaluate its effectiveness.

4. **Access to Municipal Services**

There is no formal program in Saskatoon designed to increase racial minorities' access to municipal services. However, the Community Health Unit, through its "Healthy Mother, Healthy Baby" program, provides services that improve racial minorities' access.

This program consists of providing preventive prenatal services especially to high-risk women with the potential for poor pregnancies. Because of age, nutritional status, alcohol/drug use, smoking, socio-economic status or obstetric reasons, many women are at high-risk during pregnancy. The Health unit assists these women, a majority of whom are native, by issuing milk coupons, and offering instructions in budgeting, nutrition, shopping, infant feeding, breast feeding and birth control.

As a racial group, the native community benefits from this service. To facilitate communication with the native women, the Unit has hired three native women to become lay counsellors and to do home visits. They work at building a relationship with pregnant women and give individual support.

5. **Education and School System**

One of the most important issues of concern, especially to the Aboriginal community in Saskatoon, is that of education. Traditionally low education levels among the native population in the City results in extremely limited job opportunities for them. This, in turn, continues the perennial high levels of unemployment among them.

Within the school system, the drop-out rate among native students is the highest. This is due, in part, to a lack of Aboriginal content in school curricula, absence of enough numbers of native teachers, and, a lack of special attention being given to increasing understanding of the native way of life and traditions.

Recently, several schools have introduced a few initiatives to deal with this issue. Native community workers have been hired by some schools. These people are not teachers. Rather, they are involved in imparting knowledge and information to school

students and their parents about the Aboriginal Peoples through extra-curricular activities.

For example, through the work of a native community worker, one of the schools has formed a group of "HOOP" dancers. Comprised of native students, this group performs native dances in a number of schools and in front of parent bodies. The idea is to educate and inform people through activities which are fun for both the performers and the participants. In another school, a native community worker makes presentations on such topics as what it is like being a native person.

Through initiatives of this kind, it is hoped that there will be a better understanding and acceptance of native students and their culture. This should help in making them feel much more comfortable thereby reducing their drop-out rate.

These initiatives are a start. But, there is still long way to go in Saskatoon to satisfactorily deal with the issue of education among the Aboriginal Peoples and eradicate long-standing stereotypes about them.

6. Commitment of Elected/Appointed Municipal Officials

The City of Saskatoon has recently begun its initiatives in improving race relations. In time, these initiatives should lead to some progress. However, the extremely limited resources allocated to race relations and a lack of noticeable progress raise questions about the municipality's commitment to improving race relations.

7. Police-minority Relations

There have not been incidents of police shooting in Saskatoon as in Montreal and Toronto in the last few years. However, there are complaints about police prejudice and stereotyping of minorities, especially of members of native communities.

Like most other Canadian cities, there are very few members of racial minorities in the Saskatoon Police Department. Of its force of 355 officers, only two are of native ancestry, one is of Southeast Asian origin, and one is Black.

The department has been endeavouring to increase minority recruitment, but their efforts have not been very successful. With regard to understanding of racial minorities, approximately 80 % of Saskatoon's police force have gone through multicultural training. This, as part of the overall training program, is required by the Saskatchewan Police Commission.

3.3.2 FCM

In Saskatoon, knowledge of and familiarity with the FCM Race Relations Program is extremely limited among both municipal officials and community representatives.

The main thrust of suggestions for FCM was that as a smaller city located in a large region, the Saskatoon could benefit greatly from more ongoing contacts with FCM.

3.3.3 IN CLOSING....

Saskatoon has initiated a few measures to deal with race relations issues. But, in view of the magnitude of the issues especially as they relate to the Aboriginal Peoples, the City's initiatives appear to be too little. There is a need for much greater effort, attention and resources to race relations.

The City of Saskatoon presents an excellent example of municipalities which need and can benefit immensely from participation in the FCM Program. Like Halifax, initiatives in Saskatoon are relatively recent, and it is at this stage, that more guidance and direction could assist the City greatly.

At the same time, FCM should inquire further into Saskatoon's the use of the equivalency skills testing program which other cities can learn to learn from for their own employment equity programs.

3.4 WINNIPEG

Winnipeg is one of the most culturally and racially diverse cities in Canada. Among its racial minority groups, the largest consists of people who have a South East Asian ethnic origin. Close to 32,000 person in 1986 belonged to this ethnic category followed by Aboriginal Peoples (over 28,000), those of South Asian origin (almost 8,000) and Blacks (close to 6,000).

3.4.1 RACE RELATIONS ISSUES AND MUNICIPAL ACTIONS

Current race relations issues in Winnipeg include: policing-minority relations, employment, and minority access to municipal services.

Like other Canadian cities, Winnipeg has also experienced increasing incidents of vandalism, desecration of synagogues and spread of hate literature. This has added significantly to racial tensions in the City which has been marked by stereotyping, prejudice and discrimination against Aboriginal Peoples.

Long-standing problems faced by Winnipeg's Aboriginal community are fundamental to understanding race relations issues in the City.

The biggest issue is the relationship between Aboriginal Peoples and the police. In spite of the recognition and acknowledgement of the problem by everyone concerned, attempts at resolving the differences have not been very productive. In the eyes of the native community members, police officers continue to treat them with the same kind of stereotypes and prejudice which have characterized police dealings with natives for decades.

Unemployment among the Aboriginal community far exceeds the rate for the rest of the city, and with extremely low levels of education, native people have great difficulty finding jobs. Those who have jobs mostly work in low-paying menial jobs which are more susceptible to the vagaries of economics and seasons.

The school system in Winnipeg has also failed the native community. There are not enough teachers or people on the school boards from among the Aboriginal Peoples. Likewise, churches have failed to address the native issues satisfactorily.

To make matters worse, a native ghetto has been created in the north end of the town and it seems like an almost impossible task for them to get out of the ghetto. And, the vicious cycle of unemployment, poverty, and societal mistreatment continues.

1. Police-minority Relations

The Aboriginal Justice Inquiry conducted in 1989 has

brought out a number of issues related to police-minority relations. Perhaps the most fundamental of these issues are: a lack of police sensitivity to and empathy for racial communities; and, inadequate representation of minorities in the police force.

A recent example of police insensitivity and understanding occurred in June, 1989, when two officers entered the apartment of a person of native origin without a search warrant and seized a number of religious items under the provincial Wildlife Act.

This Act prohibits possession of parts of certain endangered species like bald and golden eagles without a permit. Among the items taken away by the police were feathers used for ceremonial purposes at Aboriginal events.

Although these items were returned to their owner, the incident added to an already hostile feeling among the Aboriginal community towards police.

In order to improve relations with Aboriginal and other Visible Minority groups, beginning in April, 1989, the Winnipeg Police Department commenced a 5-year Plan of Action. The plan has four components: i) Image Change, ii) Recruitment, iii) Statistical Progress, and, iv) Community Policing.

Within each of these components a number of initiatives and activities are planned with a view to increasing racial minority representation in relation with the police department.

A special training program has been introduced for the purpose of training racial minority candidates in preparing themselves for police careers. The program is a part of the department's community outreach approach. So far, the results appear to be mixed. In all, 30 of Winnipeg's police force of about 1,000 are members of Visible Minorities and Aboriginal Peoples.

2. Employment in Municipal Government

The City of Winnipeg introduced its Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) program in 1981. The program initially focused on women, however, other target groups, namely Visible Minorities, Aboriginal Peoples and persons with disability, have subsequently been added.

Of its workforce of approximately 12,000 people including full and part-time workers, 5.1 % are members of Visible Minorities and 1.4 % are from the Aboriginal community. These figures are short of the labour force availability data for the Census Metropolitan Area (CMA) of Winnipeg. Labour force availability for Visible Minorities was 7.8 % and for Aboriginal Peoples, 3.2 %.

However, for management positions, the record of the City of

Winnipeg for Visible Minorities is better than labour force availability. In the Winnipeg CMA labour force, availability for Visible Minorities ranged from 2.1 % for supervisors to 0.5 % for upper level managers. In the Winnipeg municipal service, on the other hand, 4.8 % of all middle and senior level managers were from Visible Minorities. Targeted recruiting for management positions appears to have been a factor responsible for this positive result of the Winnipeg program.

The Equal Employment Opportunity program of the City of Winnipeg does not require setting of goals and time tables as in an employment equity program. The Winnipeg program operates on the basis of collection and analysis of internal and external workforce data, setting of objectives, determining strategies to attain objectives, and reviewing and revising action plans.

In order to reach out to racial minority communities, the City established, about two years ago, a full-time Outreach Coordinator position. The incumbent works under the Equal Employment Opportunity Coordinator in the Personnel Department, and is responsible for ongoing communication, consultation and networking with the communities. The present incumbent is of native origin.

3. Communication with Racial Communities

In recognition of Winnipeg's multi-ethnic, multi-racial character, and to increase City's communication and relations with its racial communities, an Advisory Committee on Race Relations was put into place in 1981. This committee demonstrated the need for a formal and legislated committee and a co-ordinator to attend to issues of race relations. As a result, the City Council established a Community and Race Relations Committee in 1986.

The Committee has a wide-ranging mandate which requires it to deal with such matters as development of policies and programs to foster harmonious race relations, as well as initiation, mediation and coordination of discussions among minority and Native groups and other groups to promote better understanding.

Comprised of a total of 16 members, the Committee membership includes 4 municipal officials includes: the Mayor and the Chief of Police, 5 members from other institutions (e.g. post-secondary educational institutions, the Chamber of Commerce, the Canadian Union of Public Employees, the Association of School Trustees, and the International Centre), and 9 members from native and racial minority/ethnic communities.

Municipal officials are appointed on a continuous basis, 5 institutional representatives are appointed for two-year terms, and 9 community members are appointed for a one-year rotating term basis. Vacancies of community positions are advertised in

local and ethnic media, and appointments are made following a nominations process and consultations with communities.

There is also a full-time co-ordinator for the Committee.

In carrying out its mandate, the Committee has established a Steering Committee and three sub-committees, one each on Education, Recreation and Municipal Services and Community Relations.

An important aspect of the Committee's work involves dealing with complaints of a racial nature filed by the citizens.

In 1989, a total of 37 such complaints were filed. Of these, the Committee resolved 30 complaints during the year.

In addition to specific complaints, the Committee dealt with a total of 54 race relations issues during the year.

Another aspect of the Committee's work involves preparation and presentation of briefs. Examples include briefs to the Manitoba Task Force on Multiculturalism, the Aboriginal Justice Inquiry, and a presentation at the 1989 FCM National Symposium.

Other Committee activities include: attendance at conferences and seminars, holding and conducting workshops and seminars (in 1989, 102 such events were held with local community groups, churches and schools), appearance on the local news media to discuss issues of concern, attending various community functions, meeting with City departments, and, Court appearances on behalf of complainants about race related matters.

4. Vandalism, Desecration, Racist Graffiti, and Spread of Hate Literature and Material

Racist pins with a caption "Who is the minority in Canada ?" and showing a black, an Asian and a Sikh first appeared in Manitoba in late 1989. These pins were followed by the distribution of a handbill in Northern Manitoba that declared "open season" on Indians. Written in the format of a provincial hunting regulation, the handbill advocated the use of traps and bullets to kill Indians. "These welfare recipients must be thinned out every three years", the handbill declared (the Globe and Mail dated January 3, 1990).

While racial minority organizations and human rights activists were enraged by these events, no action was forthcoming from any levels of government. The controversy intensified when a salesman began selling racist calendars in bars in Winnipeg and other parts of the province. Designed to fuel the controversy around allowing Sikhs to wear turbans in the RCMP, the calendar depicted a grinning Sikh in an RCMP uniform. The caption under the picture read "Is this Canadian or does this make you Sikh ?"

These events have left their scars on racial minorities in Winnipeg, and the concern about a lack of timely and adequate government response still remains.

5. Access to Municipal Services

As a highly racially diverse city, Winnipeg faces the constant challenge of access to municipal services by racial minorities.

Recognizing the existence of barriers of language as well as a lack of understanding of minority concerns, the Health Department is planning to conduct a survey to determine the need for interpreters in delivering its services to racial minorities. Scheduled for September, the survey is expected to result in specific measures directed at improving access to minorities.

Other initiatives designed to provide greater access to racial minorities include measures taken by the Winnipeg Core Area Initiative (WCAI). A joint undertaking of the federal, provincial and municipal governments, WCAI is an urban revitalization project addressing physical, economic and social concerns of the inner city to provide a uniquely comprehensive approach to urban revitalization.

With the heavy concentration of racial minority and Aboriginal Peoples in the inner city, a special effort is made to provide opportunities to members of these communities.

Accordingly, in all aspects of the Core Area Initiative, Aboriginal Peoples and racial minorities are given special consideration (along with women and persons with disabilities).

Examples of the kind of programs completed by the WCAI are: a program called "English for Science and Technology" which expanded special purpose language training to refugees and immigrants; "Youth Entry", a 12-month program to prepare high-risk Indo-Chinese youth to enter the workforce; on-site skill development and employment preparation for immigrant and native employment services; and, cross-cultural workshops for supervisors and front-line management.

6. Commitment of Elected/Appointed Municipal Officials

A major area of concern is the limited understanding of elected municipal councillors about issues of race relations, diversity, and Aboriginal matters. This appears to result in their lack of commitment to these issues, and therefore, a lack of progress.

It was pointed out that in the municipal election of fall 1989, 13 of 29 councillors were elected for the first time. This

poses a big challenge to City officials and community representatives in dealing effectively with the issues of race relations.

3.4.2 FCM

FCM material is used by those municipal officials who are involved in dealing with the issues of race relations and employment equity. They view the FCM Race Relations Program as a very useful source of ideas and information.

Most community representatives, except for a few who have had involvement in some FCM activities, have very little knowledge about the FCM Race Relations Program.

3.4.3 IN CLOSING....

Winnipeg has been involved in dealing with race relations issues for some years, and through its Race Relations Committee, the City has provided leadership in a number of areas.

It seems, however, that because of the magnitude of race relations issues, especially in dealing with the Aboriginal Peoples, these efforts are not producing visible results.

3.5 TORONTO

Recognized by the United Nations as the most ethnically and racially diverse city in the world, Toronto's race relations issues are highly complex and vast in magnitude.

As reported by Statistics Canada, in 1986, of a total population of close to 3.4 million in the Census Metropolitan Area (CMA) of Toronto, 586,495 people belonged to Visible Minorities This is the largest concentration of racial communities in Canada, and it accounts for 17.2 % of the CMA's population.

The largest racial minority group in Toronto is comprised of people who have an origin in East and Southeast Asia. There were 230,355 persons in that group followed by people of a South Asian origin (125,385) and Blacks (123,705).

Aboriginal Peoples in Toronto numbered close to 33,000. Other people in Toronto belonging to a large variety of racial groups include: those from the Caribbean, and persons of Arab origin. The greater influx of refugees from Latin and South America is adding more Spanish-speaking people to the multicultural/ multiracial mosaic of Toronto.

3.5.1 RACE RELATIONS ISSUES AND MUNICIPAL ACTIONS

Jolted by racial strife and tension in the 70's, Toronto has undertaken a number of initiatives to improve race relations in the City. Notwithstanding these initiatives, however, the race relations climate in the City has deteriorated in the last few years. Issues that have contributed to this deterioration are discussed below.

1. Police Minority Relations

At this time, this is perhaps the most predominant race relations issue in Toronto. There has always been a certain degree of uneasiness in relations between the Toronto police force and its racial groups, especially the Black community. And, police shootings of Black youths in the last two years have made the issue a top priority item for racial communities and municipal, provincial, and federal governments.

A number of actions, including a revised Police Services Act, are being undertaken following the release of the Report of the Race Relations and Policing Task Force in 1989. In the meantime, however, the situation has deteriorated further with the shooting of another black teenager in May, 1990, by a Toronto police officer. This incident has taken police-minority relations to its lowest possible level.

To deal with this situation, the Metro Toronto Police has increased its efforts in all areas of relations with minorities. These include: hiring of racial minority members; training and sensitization; and police-minority committees.

As a result of increased efforts, the Metro Police has already hired 51 members of Visible Minorities this year, including 8 women. Its goal for the year is 67 Visible Minorities, and the expectation is that this goal will be surpassed before year end. Overall, however, Visible Minority representation is only 4.6 % of Metro's police force of 5,600.

Therefore, special community outreach initiatives aimed at hiring minorities are being pursued vigorously. These initiatives consist of, among other things: information seminars for potential recruits; meetings tailored to specific communities; and, mentoring of minority recruits.

In the area of training, in addition to continuing its cross-cultural communication program, the Metro Police holds sensitization and information sessions on issues of concern to specific minority communities. This is an ongoing program which consists of a number of different sessions and approaches.

The Metro Toronto Police personnel meet with racial minority communities regularly through a variety of committees. For example, there are committees aimed at individual groups, e.g. Blacks, Aboriginal Peoples, East Indian, Francophone, etc. In addition, there is a Citizens' Advisory Committee for recruitment. These and other committees provide a forum for discussion of issues of mutual concern and an ongoing network of contacts and links.

2. Employment in Municipal Government

The City of Toronto introduced its "Equal Opportunity Program" as early as 1973, earlier than any other municipality in Canada. At that time, the program was directed primarily at women as a target group. Subsequently, other groups have been added to the list of target groups. People with disabilities were added as a target group in 1981; Visible Minorities were added in 1982; and, Aboriginal Peoples in 1986.

Under this program, department heads are required to set specific goals for increasing representation of target groups. The goals are set by occupation, and timetables are specified for reaching the goals. Providing research, information, advice and support to department heads is the Employment Opportunity Division in the Management Services Department. An annual report of the progress in achieving goals is made to the City Council by the Personnel Committee.

An important adjunct to the employment equity program of the

City is its Contract Compliance Program. This program has three components.

The first component deals with groups and organizations which annually receive approximately $10 million worth of grants from the City. The second component has extended the application of the program to 26 civic boards and commissions which employ about 2,500 people. These two components came into effect in October, 1985. Organizations covered are required to implement a program of goals and time-tables to improve representation of target groups in their employment.

The third component further extended the application of the program to the private sector doing business with the City. As of July 3, 1989, all firms wishing to provide goods and services to the City of Toronto, are required to file data on the characteristics of their workforces including salary information. And, firms which are successful in their bids to provide business to the City must agree to adopt, post and uphold non-discrimination policies.

Covered by these provisions are firms which annually provide approximately $150 million worth of goods and services to the City as well as financial institutions with whom the City invests close to $1 billion.

In addition to the Contract Compliance Program, the Equal Opportunity Division has set up a "Women in Work Institute" to address specific issues of concern to women in the workforce. The Division also administers the Literacy Program and the Human Rights Management Program of the City Of Toronto.

As a result of these initiatives, a noticeable progress has been achieved. In 1983, only 6.5 % of the City's workforce was comprised of members of Visible Minorities. As of June 30, 1990, this percentage increased to 13.4 %, more than double the increase in percentage points. (The City of Toronto refers Visible Minorities as "racial minorities".).

This indicates a marked improvement; and, what is more important, improvement in minority representation has been achieved at all levels, not just at lower levels.

The following tabulation shows numbers and percentages of Visible Minorities at selected levels as compared to the labour force availability data for Visible Minorities, data compiled by Statistics Canada.

As can be seen from this tabulation, in management, semi-professional and technician categories, the City of Toronto workforce is very much in line with the availability of Visible Minorities in the labour force in the Metro Toronto area. For professionals, the Toronto record is better than the labour force. And overall, the City is somewhat behind the labour force.

EMPLOYMENT EQUITY FOR RACIAL MINORITIES

Visible Minorities in city of Toronto workforce and labour force availability for Visible Minorities

	City of Toronto June 30, 1990		Labour Force 1986 Census
	No.	% of total in Category	%
Upper Level Managers	9	7.3	7.7
Middle & Oth.Managers	46	9.1	9.8
Professionals	150	19.6	16.0
Semi-Prof.& Tech.	77	15.1	15.9
All Employees	1,069	13.4	16.4

Source: City of Toronto figures from the Equal Employment Opportunity Division and labour force availability from Statistics Canada

As for Aboriginal Peoples, the City's performance has been just about in line with the labour force availability. In 1989, 0.7 % of the City's workers were of Aboriginal descent as compared to their labour force availability of 0.9 %.

It must be noted that, since 1986, the City of Toronto has implemented a well-defined system of goals and time tables in its employment equity program. In discussions with the Director of the Equal Employment Opportunity Division, it is clear that this fact more than anything else has led to the City's progress with respect to representation of racial minorities in its workforce.

To further increase the effectiveness of its program, the City has now placed the onus for implementing employment equity and race relations programs on its fourteen commissioners who head various departments.

Under this arrangement, three of the ten elements used to appraise commissioner performance are: human rights, employment equity and race relations. The report of their performance will go directly to the City Council Executive. This is the first year of this agreement, and it clearly reflects the serious commitment of the City of Toronto to improving representation of racial minorities and race relations in municipal government.

3. Vandalism, Racist Graffiti and Spread of Racist Material

Like other major Canadian cities, Toronto has experienced

vandalism directed at Jewish schools and synagogues, spread of racist graffiti, and distribution of racist pins, buttons, and calendars. The targets of vandalism have been Jewish schools and synagogues; whereas, distribution of racist material has been targeted primarily at other racial minorities - the Sikhs, Blacks and the Chinese.

Actions taken by the City include statements by the Mayor of Toronto against these incidents. The Department of Public Works takes the responsibility of wiping off racist graffiti.

4. Community Outreach and Communication

The matter of minority access to municipal services has been a concern of racial minorities and municipal government for a number of years. As pointed out by a few community members at a recent consultation meeting, many of the problems with access stem from a lack of knowledge about the services provided by the City.

For example, many members of minorities do not even have information on such matters as how to obtain a marriage licence.

As well, there is very little understanding of how the City Hall works, and members of some racial communities find the City Hall very intimidating. Even such things as the uniform of City Hall guards have different meanings for some of these communities.

To complicate the matter, many people have difficulty telling the difference between services provided by the City and those provided by Metro. These are but a few problems, but they indicate how a lack of information and knowledge creates difficulties in accessing municipal services.

Since 1981, when it was established, the Toronto Mayor's Committee on Community and Race Relations has been involved in a number of approaches to improving minority access to City services and community outreach and communication with racial and ethnic communities.

Chaired by the Mayor, the Committee is comprised of 15 members: 10 racial/ethnic minority community members; 2 elected municipal government representatives; and 3 other members. Assisted by a full-time Co-ordinator paid by the municipality, the Committee meets every month. Committee meetings are public.

In appointing community members, the Committee follows a well laid out process. This process consists of multilingual advertisements in the press and in the ethnic media. As well, through mailing, community organizations on the City's lists are informed of any vacancy on the committee.

This is followed by an information seminar for prospective

applicants to find out more about the Committee, its work, and what might be entailed in becoming a Committee member. A nominating committee composed of 4-5 members of the Mayor's Committee and the Director of the Equal Employment Opportunity Division screens the applications and prepares a short list of applicants who are interviewed.

Nominating committee's recommendations for appointment to the Mayor's Committee are submitted to the Mayor for approval. Upon approval by the Mayor, the recommended names are forwarded to the City Council. The Council then makes formal appointment of members on the Mayor's Committee.

Initially, members are appointed for a one-year term. But, this term is usually renewed, unless, for whatever reason, a member does not wish to or cannot continue.

Over the years, the Toronto Mayor's Committee has made an important contribution to improving race relations in the City. One of the outstanding recent examples is THE YEAR FOR RACIAL HARMONY program.

With "TOGETHER WE ARE TORONTO" as its theme, the Committee organized a number of events, activities and a promotional campaign throughout the year, 1989. A few examples of activities are: youth projects involving poetry, banner and essay competitions; the Black History month (February); approaching and securing the support of churches, synagogues, temples, mosques and other religious organizations for the program; displays in the rotunda of the City Hall to promote the importance of racial tolerance and harmony; participation in a joint multicultural community committee organizing a conference, "Toronto Cares," following the defacement of a Toronto synagogue and a fascist rally in Midland, Ont. in the Summer of 1989; sponsoring of a service providers workshop on culturally appropriate counselling for victims of family violence; and, networking.

In addition to THE YEAR FOR RACIAL HARMONY program, in 1989, the Committee was involved in three areas: community outreach, advocacy and public education.

Of particular interest has been the Committee's work in advocacy on a number of major issues:

- employment equity
- immigration issues
- employment standards for immigrant workers
- various policing issues
- social assistance reform
- mediation of community conflicts
- provision of subsidized ESL classes for immigrant women
- the Head Tax and Chinese Immigration (Exclusion) Act
- religious education in Ontario public elementary schools

In addition the Committee has planned to initiate a number of new activities such as: preparation and publication of a booklet, "Race Relations: Myths, Facts and Definitions;" the Lunch 'N Learn Authors Series for children; establishment of a sub-committee to deal with lesbian and gay community concerns; and, publication of a newsletter.

In spite of all these actions and activities, representatives of racial minority communities still feel that there is a communication gap between them and the City Hall. The challenge for the City is great because of the large number in minority communities and also because there are hundreds of community organizations.

5. Access to Municipal Services

The Toronto Mayor's Committee on Community and Race Relations has been the catalyst for action on this issue since 1984. In that year, the Committee initiated consultations with racial and ethnic groups to solicit their input on ways to improve their communities' access to municipal services.

The findings and recommendations of this committee's consultations led to the Multicultural Access to City Services Report in 1987. This report resulted in the development of the City of Toronto policy on Multicultural Access and Race Relations which recognizes:

- its obligation as a provider of public services to ensure that all City Hall services are available and accessible to all members of Toronto's diverse population

- its responsibility to remove barriers that may be presented by organizational complexity, language differences, cultural insensitivity and discriminatory attitudes and practices.

To implement this policy, the City has undertaken a number of programs and activities. The following is a brief description of major initiatives:

i) Multicultural Access Program (MAP)

MAP acts as a coordinating resource available to City departments in improving minority access. Specific MAP initiatives relate to: intercultural and race relations training; community development and outreach; communications from the City Hall; the minority business program;, affordable and refugee housing; community service needs assessment; the City grants policy; and, a multicultural resource centre and data base.

A major area of MAP's focus has been intercultural and race relations training. MAP advises and makes training material and resources available to City departments in all aspects of training: needs assessment, training design, and delivery of programs to managers and staff. To date, MAP has been instrumental in making training available to over 1400 staff and 200 supervisors and managers in various City departments.

MAP has also established six Task Groups to deal with other issues:

1. Affordable and Refugee Housing Task Group
2. Grants Review Task Group
3. Minority Business Review Task Group
4. Translation and Interpretation Services Task Group
5. Multicultural Media Review Task Group
6. Community Consultation and Outreach Task Group

Comprised of City as well as community representatives, each Task Group is chaired by a representative of the department most affected by the issue and co-chaired by a community representative. Recommendations of Task Groups are forwarded for action to appropriate personnel. Upon completion of their tasks, Task Groups are expected to disband.

ii) **Multicultural Access to Public Health Services**

In line with the 1987 report "Multicultural Access to City Services", the Department of Public Health has been addressing the needs of the ethnocultural communities in the City of Toronto. In order to ensure that public health services are accessible and linguistically and culturally appropriate, the Department has recently developed a multicultural policy.

This implementation of this policy would involve the Department will be involved in a number of policy areas: recruitment and hiring; staff training, development and orientation; succession planning and equal opportunity; data base development relevant to the health of multicultural communities; health promotion; the use of paraprofessionals and foreign-trained health professionals; representation on community advisory boards and the Board of Health; networking at local, regional, federal and international levels; a new immigrant and refugee policy; and, interpretive services.

iii) **Public Works**

Initiatives taken by the Department of Public Works include:

- multicultural access training for all personnel involved in by-law inspections and enforcement

- sensitivity training for managers and supervisory staff
- a review of translation needs for notices issued to the public
- publication of notices and an advertising campaign in ethnic press and broadcast media

iv) Planning and Development - CITYPLAN '91

Cityplan '91 is a forum for the development of a framework for a new Official Plan for the Central Area of the City of Toronto. Three themes characterize various aspects of the 1991 Plan: managing growth; improving the quality of life; and, promoting social equity.

With increasing cultural and racial diversity in Toronto, the numbers of people from ethnic groups living in this part of the City has grown considerably in the last decade. More than half of Metro's Portuguese live in the central area. The other predominant groups consist of people of Chinese descent and increasing numbers of Spanish-speaking people. Therefore, addressing the specific needs and concerns of these communities is vital to Cityplan '91.

In order to provide liaison and to facilitate communication with cultural and racial communities in the Central Area, the department has engaged a Multicultural Consultant. The consultant has undertaken a variety of outreach initiatives including meetings with community organizations, social service agencies, and the ethnic media.

To facilitate dialogue with non-English speaking citizens, the department provides multilingual communication services. Also, meetings are held at locations preferred by community members at times convenient to them. The goal is to ensure that members of cultural/racial minority groups living in the central area have full opportunity to know of various aspects of the Cityplan '91 and make their input into the process.

iv) Other

There are other examples of initiatives by other City departments designed to improve minority access to City services. One such example is the implementation of a program to increase the participation of Visible Minorities in aquatic activities in the Parks and Recreation Department. Carried on for the last three years, the program has been successful in attracting more minority youth to work at City facilities thus reflecting the multiracial dimension of Toronto's population and diminish a barrier that may inhibit racial minorities from making full use of these facilities.

6. **Commitment of Elected/Appointed City Officials**

In Toronto, this has not been raised as a major issue of concern to racial minority community members. While there have been a few rumblings, these are exceptions. People who have some knowledge of the City's efforts are generally satisfied that there is commitment to improving race relations at the highest levels of the City's political and bureaucratic hierarchies.

3.5.2 FCM

As in other cities, familiarity with and knowledge of the FCM program and initiatives in race relations are confined primarily to those who are directly involved in any of the FCM activities and those who have attended a symposium or a workshop organized by FCM.

Suggestions for FCM ranged from publication of more "How To" manuals to developing programs on specific subjects (e.g. employment equity) for smaller municipalities.

3.5.3 IN CLOSING....

As the largest city in Canada, Toronto presents a multitude of challenges in race relations. The City has been involved in dealing with these challenges for longer time than most other municipalities in the country. Therefore, Toronto has accumulated a wealth of experience and expertise on a number of aspects of race relations.

This is evident in the progress the City has made in matters such as employment equity, access to municipal services, advocacy on race relations issues and community outreach. The City has still some ways to go especially in the matter of improving communication with racial minority communities. But, there are a number of positive signs which suggest the beginning of the process of institutional change at the municipal level in Toronto.

The FCM Race Relations Program was initiated well after the beginning of some of the initiatives in Toronto. Therefore, Toronto has had a head start. However, FCM provides an effective forum for representatives of Toronto to share their experiences with other municipalities who are relative newcomers on the scene. The fact that the Mayor of Toronto chairs the FCM National Action Committee is an extremely important element in the FCM Program. And, more opportunities must be given for others to learn from Toronto's experience and for Toronto to build on its foundation.

3.6 Montréal

NOTE: This case study was written by the City of Montreal.

In terms of intercultural and interracial relations, Montréal shares many similarities with other large Canadian cities but is at the same time distinct in other ways.

Montréal has historically been a major point of entry for successive waves of immigrants to Canada, many of whom settled in Montréal.

It is only recently that the multi-ethnic reality of this metropolitain centre has become an issue of concern to the majority Francophone population (the Province of Québec has been involved with immigration issues since 1968).

The majority is now conscious that as immigration continues at its present rate, the "old stock Francophone" could become a minority in his/her own city.

Faced with this demographic change there is a real concern and desire to preserve the French language as the binding and integrating fabric for this new population.

The view is that immigrants must adapt to a situation where they are required by law to integrate in French to Québec society.

Whereas earlier immigrants tended to be white and of European origin, the current composition includes a large percentage of immigrants and refugees from the Third World.

This change has led to incidents of racial discrimination, a situation which has only begun to be addressed by the city in the last few years.

According to Statistics Canada, in 1986, the largest Visible Minority group in the Montréal Census Metropolitan Area was comprised of people of East and South East Asian ethnic origin who numbered over 54 000 followed by Blacks (over 49 000), and those of Arab (29 530), Aboriginal Peoples (22 700), and South Asian (20 645) origins.

The Visible Minorities' population in the Montréal Census Metropolitan Area was 204 740 in 1986, which amounted to 7.1% of the total popultion of 2.9 million. Within the racial minority population, 42% had a mother tongue which was neither French nor English; 23% had French as a mother tongue; 20% were those whose mother tongue was English; and, the remaining 15% reported multiple languages that included either English and/or French.

Among other ethnic minority groups (i.e. non-visible ethnocultural groups), those of Italian origin were by far the largest group. They numbered over 186 000 followed by people of Jewish (96 470) and German (45 015) origins.

Part of the uniqueness of Montréal stems from the fact that, whereas in the past almost all immigrants to Québec were either Anglophone or Allophone, during the 1970's and 1980's many immigrants have been Francophone.

Consequently, ethnic and visible minorities are now present within Francophone as well as Anglophone linguistic groups.

The Black community, for example, now has a large percentage of Francophones of Haïtian origin. Similarily, a large number of North Africans, Lebanese and Vietnamese immigrants are either Francophone or have French as a second language. Moreover, as in the past, large numbers of immigrants arrive speaking neither French nor English. This situation makes it incumbent upon the municipal administration to address the questions related to the harmonious integration of all its minorities as a priority issue.
Among other ethnic minority groups (i.e. non-visible ethnocultural groups), those of Italian origin were by far the largest group. They numbered over 186 000 followed by people of Jewish (96 470) and German (45 015) origins.

Part of the uniqueness of Montréal stems from the fact that, whereas in the past almost all immigrants to Québec were either Anglophone or Allophone, during the 1970's and 1980's many immigrants have been Francophone.

Consequently, ethnic and visible minorities are now present within Francophone as well as Anglophone linguistic groups.

The Black community, for example, now has a large percentage of Francophones of Haïtian origin. Similarily, a large number of North Africans, Lebanese and Vietnamese immigrants are either Francophone or have French as a second language. Moreover, as in the past, large numbers of immigrants arrive speaking neither French nor English. This situation makes it incumbent upon the municipal administration to address the questions related to the harmonious integration of all its minorities as a priority issue.

3.6.1 Race Relations Issues and Municipal Actions

Issues of Race Relations have been pushed to the forefront of the agenda of both the City of Montréal and the Montréal Urban Community.

In the last few years, a number of racist incidents have heightened the concern and awareness for Human Rights issues and

for Race Relations in Montréal as well as throughout the rest of Canada. Two events, however, highlighted the need for change: discrimination against Haïtians in the taxi industry and the shooting of a Black youth by police. Both incidents were subjects of full-scale public enquiries held by the Québec Human Rights Commission.

Concurrently, in this new climate of heightened interracial tensions and high expectations, a new City of Montréal Administration was brought into power, with an ambitious political program to address these questions.

This context of changing political trends and growing public participation in the municipal political process in Montréal encouraged minority groups to demand more appropriate policies of the Montréal Municipal Administration.

On March 21, 1989, the Montréal Administration signed a solemn declaration committing itself to fight against all forms of discrimination and proclaimed March 21 as the day dedicated to opposition to all forms of discrimination. The Declaration has since been posted in all municipal buildings.

Some of the major initiatives taken by the Administration are addressed further on in this study. However, it should be noted that the Montréal Administration now supports and contributes to many cultural and recreational initiatives organized by racial and ethnic minorities. Furthermore, the streets and parks of Montréal are now bearing names of prominent figures from these same communities.

Race relations are being treated on a horizontal basis and all the City Services and Departments are required to include integration activities in their regular activities.

1. Access to Municipal Services

The Municipal Government has set up 13 access offices (Bureau Accès Montréal) throughout the city where citizens of any ethnic origin may obtain municipal services in French or English.

For non French or English speaking minorities the problems are more complex. However, the City has tried to address this problem by creating a Bureau d'aide aux nouveaux arrivants (a newcomers office) which dispenses social assistance to refugees in 22 languages.

To deal effectively with the issues of access to municipal services and information, an Intercultural Bureau was created in March, 1988. The purpose of the Bureau is to increase participation of cultural communities in all aspects of the

City's life. Within the Municipal Government, the Bureau serves as its conscience, and externally, it endeavours to provide a link between cultural communities and the municipality.

Staffed by a multicultural, multiracial team of ten men and women, the Bureau has been involved in a variety of community outreach and communication activities aimed at a better understanding and resolution of the issues. These activities include: meetings with ethnic community members and organizations; inserting advertisements and news items in 23 ethnic newspapers and newsletters; attendance and participation at ethnic events and meetings; and, ongoing monitoring of developments relating to ethnic affairs.

To ensure a better dissemination of information about Municipal Departments, the Intercultural Bureau broadcasts information programs on the electronic media of a number of cultural communities: Portuguese, Spanish, Italian and Greek.

Furthermore, 25 cultural community newspapers receive a monthly column containing information on the City of Montréal. The column is translated into Greek, Italian, Portuguese, Spanish, Chinese, English and a number of other languages.

The Intercultural Bureau also acts in an advisory capacity to Municipal Departments to ensure that city's programs and policies increasingly reflect the needs of the various cultural communities living in the city.

Of all of the issues of access, perhaps the most pressing is the one related to housing. Members of racial minority communities, and especially those who are recent arrivals to the City, experience subtle and sometimes not so subtle racism when they look for accommodation.

The Socité d'habitation et de développement de Montréal (SHDM) is a paramunicipal agency of the City responsible for the creation of new forms of low cost public housing in Montréal. It is a non-profit organization and runs a housing development consisting of 4 000 homes, 200 rooms and 20 large scale housing projects. A 1988 study illustrated a lack of sensitization about the concerns of racial minorities among the SHDM. This lack of sensitivity affected the ability of the SHDM to implement programs appropriate to the needs of minority groups.

To address these findings staff changes and sensitization sessions were initiated.

In order to deal effectively with the needs of new immigrants and refugees, SHDM is pursuing a special program for about a year.

The goal of SHDM is to provide quality housing at an affordable price to moderate and low income households. As well, the organization works with the private sector in trying to provide individuals with ownership of their own homes. The organization also helps to renovate run down areas, keeping in mind the architect's original plan.

With regards to the needs of new immigrants to the City, SHDM is planning to hold a certain number of units for them in areas where new immigrants generally reside. These are the areas of Côte-des-Neiges, Notre-Dame-de-Grâce, and Cartierville.

SHDM is also encouraging new immigrants to form housing Coops so that they can themselves administer a project. Under this program more immigrants are taking advantage of housing available through SHDM.

Many immigrants, however, have difficulty paying the rent because they are not able to find employment easily due to a variety of systemic barriers. The housing problem, therefore, continues to be a major concern for racial communities and a challenge for the City.

2. Employment within Municipal Government

The present Municipal Administration has, over the past several years, initiated a series of actions in both its own jurisdiction and through its role in the Montréal Urban Community (MUC) and amongst its city owned businesses and agencies.

The transit corporation, chaired by the Vice-president of the City of Montréal Executive Committee, set and achieved a 25% hiring objective for bus drivers and maintenance workers.

The advisory committee on Intercultural and Interracial relations of the MUC with strong representation of Montréal counsellors successfully recommended the adoption of an employment equity program at the MUC.

Furthermore, the Montréal Administration appointed for the first time, members of Visible and Ethnic minorities to decision making positions in upper management and to Boards of Directors in the para-municipal (city-owned) corporations under its control.

Based upon a 1988 incomplete study (33% rate of response) about 4.5% of Montréal's municipal workforce of approximately 12 000 full-time employees is comprised of cultural minorities. According to the results of this study cultural minorities are equally under represented in white collar, blue collar, professional and management categories.

To facilitate hiring of members of minority groups, Montréal introduced its Employment Equity Program, PAECC, (Le programme d'accès à l'égalité en emploi pour les communautés culturelles de la Ville de Montréal), in May, 1989.

The goal of the Program is to help integrate the over 30% of the population of the City of Montréal which is composed of ethnic minorities. (NOTE: In Montréal, the target group for employment equity is not restricted to "Visible Minorities." All "cultural communities" are considered a target group in the Montréal program).

There are three main objectives: a) to provide better access to information and services for minorities; b) to instill in minority members a sense of belonging in their communities; and, c) to provide greater access to employment.

In order to ensure hiring of members of minority groups, in January 1990, the City of Montréal announced a goal of hiring 25% of new recruits from cultural communities for jobs open to outside recruiting. The first report on the progress will be tabled in January 1991. This report will indicate whether the goal has been achieved and what changes need to be made in the program.

As well, Montréal's Intercultural Bureau and its Corporate Affairs Department have organized a series of 20 briefing sessions with cultural community organizations in the city in order to explain the hiring policy and procedures of the City of Montréal.

To inform cultural communities of available jobs with the City's workforce, the Intercultural Bureau, in conjunction with Communications and Human Resources Department, publishes municipal job notices in cultural community newspapers.

In addition, the Intercultural Bureau assists Montréal's Public Service Commission in assessing the Commission's examinations to eliminate any cultural bias in evaluating applicants. The Public Service Commission has also noticeably increased the number of professionals from visible or ethnic minorities sitting on selection committees.
There are other more specific measures undertaken by the City of Montréal. For example, a publicity campaign on careers of firefighters is organized annually. This campaign is targeted toward secondary schools with a high concentration of ethnic students. Also, the City has initiated an educational program in intercultural and interracial relations for all its employees. The primary target group for the program is managers and employees working in the Human Resources Department. The program is to start in January 1991.

To administer the program, the City has created an Employment Equity Division responsible for both the womens' program as well as the program for cultural minorities.

Just as English is a requirement for job seekers in English Canada, French is a prerequisite for employment with the City of Montréal. The level of proficiency and fluency is set by the job requirements of the particular position and is administered by the Public Service Commission.

For example, a blue collar post in the Parks maintenance division would not require the same language skills as that of a secretarial position.

This requirement is a handicap for all persons seeking employment with insufficient French language skills.

Perhaps of greater importance, are barriers faced by all minorities generally and which are very similar to those experienced by racial/cultural communities in other Canadian cities: the attitude of managers and supervisors; non-recognition of foreign credentials (a subject which is under provincial jurisdiction).

Of overriding importance is a lack of adequate information about available jobs and the problem of matching supply and demand in given disciplines and specialties.

3. Communication with Racial Minorities

With over 30% of its population being of ethnic minority origins, the City of Montréal has the enormous task of communicating effectively with these communities. Both the languages barriers and the fact that many community members feel left out of the decision-making process add to the challenge.

The task of communicating with racial and ethnic minorities is entrusted to the Intercultural Bureau (BIM).

Over the past 2 years, the BIM has organized 15 day long information exchange meetings between over 25 cultural community representatives, city administrators and politicians in an effort to sensitize the Administration to the specific needs of the given communities and to inform the communities of the range of city services available.

To provide ongoing discussion of issues and an exchange of information with ethnocultural communities, an Advisory Committee on Intercultural and Interracial Relations was established on March 21, 1990. Chaired by a community member, the Committee is comprised of 13 members. All but two of these members are from

ethnic and visible minority groups. In order to demonstrate the importance that it acccords to this Committee, the Administration voted an operating budget which provides a 200 $ honorarium for Committee members. This is in line with the honoraria received by board members of city owned corporations but is a first for Montréal area race relations committees. The Intercultural Bureau ensures support and secretarial services to the Committee.

The mandate of the Committee is as follows:

- To propose to the Executive Committee short and long term strategies and actions to improve intercultural and interracial relations in the City of Montréal.

- To advise the Executive Committee of the City of Montréal on municipal policies aimed at integration and participation of cultural communities in the life of Montrealers.

- To bring to the attention of the Executive Committee all matters which call for municipal authority's consideration and action.

While the City's committee is recent, a committee has been active at the MUC for over four years. In addition, at the MUC, a position of Coordinator of Intercultural Relations has been established in the President's office. Appointed nine months ago, the incumbent reports directly to the MUC's President.

4. Desecration of Cemeteries and Vandalism

Like other urban centres in Canada, Montréal has experienced incidents of desecration of Jewish cemeteries, vandalism of synagogues and racist graffiti. These acts are no longer isolated actions committed by a lunatic fringe.

5. Commitment of Elected/Appointed Municipal Officials

After decades of inaction on ethnic and racial issues, the present Administration has begun addressing these issues. An indicator of their commitment is the number of initiatives undertaken by the City: establishment of the Intercultural Bureau; the introduction of an employment equity program; the issuance of a policy on relations with cultural communities; the formation of an Advisory Committee on Intercultural and Interracial Relations and the Declaration against all forms of discrimination.

While most feel that these measures are commendable there is considerable pressure to accelerate the political agenda in order to meet the high level of expectations. Minorities groups

continue to be vigilant of the Administration actions as there is a fear that without pressure "Political will" will not be sufficient motivation to continue to affect positive change.

Whereas, some measures have already shown their effectiveness it is too early to judge the effectiveness of others.

6. Police-Minority Relations

The shooting of a black youth three years ago triggered emotional debate and reaction among racial minorities in Montréal. These incidents also served as a catalyst for sensitizing the Montréal Urban Community (MUC) Police Service to the need for a better understanding of and relations with racial minority groups.

MUC's Police Service's actions to impr ve race relations have concentrated on three major areas:

i. hiring of minority recruits; ii. improved training; iii. community outreach and communication.

i. The MUC Police Service has a force of 4 400 of which only 21 or 0.5% are members from Visible Minorities. Therefore, this has been a matter of high priority. This summer, under the Visible Minority Student Hiring Program supported by Multiculturalism and Citizenship Canada, 20 students worked with the Police Department. They have been exposed to all of the major aspects of police work with a view to getting to know the police function for a possible career choice.

Also, a consultant has been engaged to develop specific approaches to increasing minority representation.

As in other cities, in Montréal the matter of attracting recruits from cultural communities has been a big challenge. Because of a lack of adequate information about the policing function in Canada as well as their own back-home experiences with the police, members of cultural communities often do not understand what is involved in a career as a police officer. Through its outreach and communication activities, the MUC is endeavouring to break through this barrier.

ii. The second area in which major improvements have been made in the last couple of years is that of police training on intercultural understanding. The revised program was experimented with in four districts where some 500 officers underwent the training last year. Based on this experience, a pilot project will be conducted between September and December,

1990, with four other districts. Another group of 500 officers will undergo the training. The present plans are to give this training, beginning January, 1991, to officers in all 24 districts of MUC. It will be a compulsory program.

The program has been highly successful as an experiment and the MUC Police Service is confident that, when it is offered to all police officers, it will pave the way for improved police-minority relations.

iii. Closely linked to initiatives to increase minority hiring and improved police training are the community outreach efforts of the Police Department. These efforts consist of participation in cultural community activities, networking, and ongoing communications with members of cultural communities.

Familiarity with the FCM's Race Relations Program is limited to those directly involved in the FCM activities. The FCM initiatives are highly regarded by those individuals, and its publications are well read and referred to in developing their own actions. Most of the others in municipal service or outside, know very little, if anything about the FCM Program.

IN CLOSING

Race relations are now an issue of public policy in Montréal.

Demographic trends related to declining birth-rates and immigration will probably mean that the percentage of Montrealers who are neither of French nor British origin will increase over the next ten years.

Montréal's unique situation has permitted it to develop in the last few years an intercultural approach. This new concept differs from others in that it promotes contacts between the various cultural communities with French as the binding thread of communication and harmonisation.

In the context of the Constitutional debate, it is to be expected that the role of Québec as a francophone society will be enhanced in the coming years by the acquisition of additional legislative powers in areas such as immigration. Québec is no longer seen as a "province" nor is it considered to be an "enclave of French Canadian culture", by the majority of Quebecers. Rather, it is considered to constitute a national entity, which is characterized by its majority Francophone culture. Within this context, many immigrant groups feel apprehensive with regards to their role in the future Québec. The test for the future of Québec, and its cultural communities, will be the extent to which differences are tolerated and

minority rights respected within this climate of constitutional change.

Recognizing the need for priority attention to race relations issues, the City of Montréal has embarked on a number of initiatives. As most of these measures are relatively recent, it is too early to evaluate their effectiveness.

Montréal's participation in FCM activities has allowed it to network and exchange with other municipalities thereby enlarging its scope and experience in a Canadian framework. This involvement must continue.

To reassure its racial and ethnic minority communities, it is going to be incumbent upon the City to continue to demonstrate its commitment to improving race relations. With the establishment of the Advisory Committee on Intercultural and Interracial Relations, the City is moving in the right direction. It must, however, develop greater rapport and links with the minority communities. This calls for firm policies which will overcome barriers to improved interracial and intercultural relations.

3.7 HALIFAX

The two prominent racial minority groups in Halifax are the Micmac Indians and the Indigenous Blacks who settled in the region over 350 years ago.

According to the 1986 Census, there were 7,760 individuals with Black origin and 3,920 people with Aboriginal ancestry in the Halifax Census Metropolitan Area. People with Arab origin numbered 2,675 followed by those with Southeast Asian Origin (2,035) and individuals with South Asian origin (1,690). Visible Minorities in Halifax numbered 15,025, or 5.1 % of the total population of 293, 065

Both Micmac Indians and Indigenous Blacks feel that they have been left out of the decision-making processes by all levels of government, the education system and other public and private bodies. According to their spokespeople, they have been traditionally segregated, isolated and discriminated against. They suffer from low education and high unemployment levels with all the accompanying problems such situations bring.

More recent immigrants from the Middle East, the Caribbean, South and Southeast Asia are mostly from professional and business classes, and as such they are relatively better off economically. However, they too complain about barriers to meaningful participation in mainstream institutions.

3.7.1 RACE RELATIONS ISSUES AND MUNICIPAL ACTIONS

The most critical race relations issue in Halifax is that of policing and administration of the justice system. Other issues relating to employment and education are just as important; but, because of the devastating effects that accompany mistreatment by the police or miscarriage of justice, these issues have assumed a much higher profile and intensity.

1. Policing and the Justice System

The report of the Marshall Inquiry released earlier this year, provides considerable insights into the treatment of Micmac Indians by the police and the justice system. The Black community also has similar long-standing concerns about policing. A study conducted in conjunction with the Marshall Enquiry found that "blacks were more likely to be sent to jail for their crimes and less likely than whites to obtain absolute discharges" (The Globe and Mail, dated January 29, 1990).

Furthermore, there are only about a dozen black lawyers among the 1,200 lawyers practising in Nova Scotia. There is only one black judge who serves in the Family Court. There are no Micmac lawyers or judges. No Micmac has even served on a jury in the province. (The Globe and Mail, dated January 29,1990)

In the Halifax Police Department, of a total police force of approximately 200, there are only 6 black officers and there is no Aboriginal officer.

To improve police-minority relations, about two years ago, a Race Relations Officer was appointed in each of the three zone offices of the Police Department. Working out of the Community Services Office in their zones, these officers communicate, interact and liaise with the community in their zones on an ongoing basis and undertake other outreach activities.

In each zone there is a 12-member Community Advisory Board on which members of racial minority communities are also represented. The Race Relations Officer works with this board to provide continuous community liaison and monitoring of developments.

As part of its efforts to improve police-minority relations, the Halifax Police Department is planning to hold a 2 1/2-day consultation conference in October, 1990. Some 200 high school students will participate in the conference along with representatives of over 30 community groups, the RCMP and police officers from Halifax, Dartmouth and Bedford. A number of other initiatives such as an ongoing training and sensitization program, are likely to emerge from this conference.

Another Police Department initiative involved hiring three students from racial minorities throughout the summer months under the Visible Minority Student Hiring Program supported by Multiculturalism and Citizenship Canada. The idea was to expose the students to various police functions and operations so that they would become familiar with policing and careers in policing.

2. Employment in Municipal Services

Formidable systemic and attitudinal barriers exist for members of minority communities. These barriers take a variety of forms: a lack of opportunities for education and training; discriminatory attitudes; absence of role models; communication problems; non-recognition of foreign professional qualifications and experience; requirement of Canadian experience; ghettoization in low-paying and non-management jobs; and, absence of an effective employment equity program.

These problems are not restricted only to Aboriginal and racial minorities. Other ethnocultural minorities, i.e. non-Visible Minorities, experience similar barriers in employment.

A number of actions have recently been taken to improve racial minority representation in the municipal government.

The City of Halifax first proposed an employment equity plan on July 27th, 1989. It focuses on the employment needs of Visible Minorities, women, persons with disabilities and Aboriginal Peoples. To meet these needs, a special committee has been set up to undertake the following actions:

- make a profile of the city workforce
- review present hiring practices
- alter recruitment practices to disadvantaged groups to make jobs more available
- set up special education and training programs to improve work skills for these groups
- obtain the services of an Employment Equity Coordinator to deal with community groups in the implementation of such programs
- consult with Unions and education programming on an ongoing basis
- explore funding potential from Federal and Provincial sources
- make public progress reports on the program every six months

An Employment Equity Co-ordinator was appointed only in February, 1990. It is too early to notice any improvement. In the meantime, a number of issues have already surfaced. These include: complaints of "lowering" of standards for fire fighter positions in order to attract minority applicants; and the union resistance.

3. Vandalism, Racist Graffiti and Hate Literature

People interviewed in Halifax did not raise this as a major issue. However, concerns were expressed that it will not be long before this becomes a real concern in Halifax.

4. Communication with Racial Minority Communities

Racial minority communities complain that they are not involved in formulating policies and programs designed to deal with their concerns.

The City does not have a race relations committee. The Mayor's Advisory Group on Multicultural Affairs (which has not been very productive) is being restructured to provide a better

means of communication with minority communities. The recent appointment of a Multiculturalism Coordinator is seen as a major attempt to establish ongoing communication with racial communities.

5. Access to Municipal Services

Because of a lack of sensitivity to and empathy for minorities' needs, ethnic and racial minority community representatives complain of inattention to their concerns by city staff. Specifically, this results in inattention to their requests and applications for services by city officials in, for example, the Engineering and Public Works Department. Other city departments and institutions also appear to be insensitive to racial minorities. An exception is the North Branch Public Library.

Located in an area populated predominantly by the Black community and some people of Vietnamese and Lebanese origin, North Branch Library is a community-based library. The library personnel as well as its contents reflect the community it serves. Staff is multiracial and the library boasts of perhaps the best collection of material by and about Black people.

North Branch Library solicits and receives community input in its programs through a variety of means: a women's group which meets once a week, an adult upgrading program, and, an informal network with members of the community. The library also organizes public forums on issues of community concern.

For example, last year, following a murder incident in the community, the library organized a public forum and followed this up with a campaign to put pressure on City officials to establish a community-based police office. This campaign resulted in such an office being set up in the community with two officers assigned to it.

Thus, North Branch Library has transformed the traditional concept of a library with pin-drop silence and hushed voices to a vibrant community-based institution that provides leadership on community issues.

Apart from the North Branch Library exception, there is no formal program in Halifax to provide greater access to municipal services for racial minorities.

With support from the Secretary of State, a full-time Multiculturalism Coordinator was appointed in May, 1990. The incumbent is charged with the responsibility of identifying barriers to city services by liaising with and gathering information from minority communities.

6. Commitment of Elected/Appointed Municipal Officials

The commitment of the Mayor is not questioned. Indeed, most people interviewed unequivocally state their confidence in the sincerity and commitment of the mayor. However, some community members express concerns about the commitment of the members of the City Council and senior appointed city officials. In their opinion, this lack of commitment translates into a lack of progress on race relations issues, an absence of a race relations policy adopted by the City Council, and, a lack of enough of its own financial resources devoted by the City to deal with race relations matters.

7. The Education and School System

There are a number of concerns with the education and school system. The first concern is with the lack of sufficient content in school curricula about Aboriginal, Black and other racial communities, their culture and their history. Secondly, there are relatively very few teachers from racial minorities; and thirdly, minority students are systematically pushed into courses which offer little chance for advancement and economic opportunities.

A number of initiatives have been undertaken to improve the education system. For example, the **Four Plus Program** is intended for preschoolers, mainly four year olds from the inner city schools. The program is intended to give children a firmer base when they start school by giving them an extra year to concentrate on literacy as well as mathematical skills. To date, over 600 children have benefitted from the program.

Another example is the **Unity in Writing** program. Intended mainly for children attending Rockingstone Heights school, this program involves children taking home "reading logs" set up by their teachers. These logs contain the thoughts of the students and are intended to be read by the student's entire family. It is hoped that family members will as well participate and add to the logs. The program is undertaken to encourage student as well as family participation in the student's learning in the hope that it will keep a closeness in the lives of these inner city families.

Another initiative is the **"Education Supplement"**, a newsletter published by the Halifax District School Board. This newsletter carries a number of news items and photographs of students from Black and other racial minorities to inform the community at large of the achievements of these students.

Despite these programs, however, racial minorities' basic concerns with the education system remain. A lack of content about racial communities, an absence of teachers from these

communities and systematic streamlining of children from these communities into courses with low opportunities combine to produce a lack of interest, and high drop-out rates of minority students.

3.7.2 FCM

Those municipal officials and community members who are directly involved in the FCM Race Relations Program indicate that the Program is having a positive impact on the activities now being undertaken in the City of Halifax. As stressed by one official, "FCM has been the rallying point for the City".

Interviews with people who are not involved in the FCM Program in any way, however, revealed that they have very little knowledge of and familiarity with the FCM Program. This includes people in the racial minority communities as well as others.

A major suggestion for FCM was that particular attention be given to cities which are in a similar situation as Halifax. As a smaller city with limited resources, the City of Halifax does not have the financial and other means to deal adequately with race relations issues on its own. To be effective, the City must depend on the expertise and resources available through other sources, especially through FCM.

3.7.3 IN CLOSING....

The City of Halifax has taken a number of strides in the last eighteen months in an attempt to improve race relations. The City has a long way to go in integrating race relations in its policies, programs, practices and procedures. But, with the sincerity displayed by its Mayor, Halifax appears genuinely committed to achieving improved race relations.

The involvement of City officials in FCM activities such as attendance at the 1989 National Symposium, participation in the National Action Committee, and organizing of the Regional Symposium, "Crossroads 90" have generated motivation, energy and ideas for the City's program. In that sense the FCM Race Relations Programs is having a very positive impact on the City of Halifax.

In order for the City to make progress and achieve the goals of its program, it needs ongoing strong support, advice and guidance from FCM and from other cities which have greater experience.

It is important for the City to demonstrate progress with some visible action. With the appointment of an Employment Equity

Co-ordinator and a Multiculturalism Co-ordinator and with the hosting of "Crossroads 90", Halifax has made a beginning.

There is a need for the City to continue in this direction in tackling issues of employment, policing, and education. Some visible demonstration of progress in these areas is necessary in order to dispel the cynicism and scepticism of many members of racial minority communities.

PART 4: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Race relations is a highly complex subject and views of most people on various aspects of race relations are coloured by their own experiences and perceptions. This makes it almost impossible to assess the impact of the FCM Race Relations Program in terms of precise, objective measures.

However, it was possible, through the survey, to obtain some indicators of what has happened in municipal race relations since 1984. The results of the survey were analyzed in conjunction with the document and literature search and the feedback received from the people interviewed in the six cities to arrive at the following conclusions.

1. A GREAT DEAL OF ACTIVITY HAS TAKEN PLACE IN RACE RELATIONS AT THE MUNICIPAL LEVEL IN CANADA SINCE FCM FIRST TOOK ITS INITIATIVE IN 1984.

2. THE FCM RACE RELATIONS PROGRAM IS MEETING ITS OBJECTIVE OF PROMOTING INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE AND IMPROVED RACE RELATIONS IN CANADIAN MUNICIPALITIES.

3. CANADIAN MUNICIPALITIES, AND FCM FACE AN ENORMOUS CHALLENGE IN RACE RELATIONS.

4. THERE IS A CRITICAL NEED FOR A MUCH GREATER EFFORT AT BOTH THE MUNICIPAL LEVEL AND AT FCM TO FACE THE CHALLENGE OF THE 1990'S.

These conclusions are based on the following findings:

4.1. MUNICIPAL RACE RELATIONS INITIATIVES SINCE 1984

Both the survey results and the case studies indicate that since 1984, there has been a significant increase in municipal race relations initiatives.

Many municipalities which had not been active in race relations have initiated programs; and those cities which were already involved in race relations, have undertaken some very important measures towards institutional change.

Some of the salient features of municipal race relations initiatives are:

i **Municipal Race/Community Relations Committees**

There has been a significant increase in the number of municipal race/community relations committees.

Of 27 municipal race relations committee reported in the survey, 18, or two-thirds have been formed since 1984, the year in which FCM began its involvement in municipal race relations.

ii **Municipal Race/Ethnic Relations Policies**

The number of municipalities with race/ethnic relations policies has increased dramatically.

Of 22 municipalities with race/ethnic relations policies reported in the survey, 14, or 63.6 % have been developed since 1984.

iii **Municipal Outreach and Communication Programs**

Community outreach and communication programs are becoming more prevalent.

41 municipalities participated in March 21, the International Day for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination.

37 municipalities engage in other outreach and communication activities.

iv **Municipal Employment Equity Programs**

More municipalities have introduced employment equity (or equal employment opportunity) programs.

Of 28 municipalities reporting employment equity programs, 20, or 71.4 % report having introduced employment equity since 1984.

v **Municipal Education and Training Programs**

Municipalities seem to emphasize education and training programs on race/ethnic relations for staff/managers.

21 municipalities conduct some form of training for their staff/managers.

vi **Pro-active Race/Community Relations Committees**

Race relations committees in a few cities like Toronto, Vancouver, and Hamilton have become much more pro-active, and they are engaging themselves in a number of key areas: advocacy, municipal by-laws, and public education.

vii **Integration of Race Relations in Municipal Services**

As part of the process of institutional change, multiculturalism and race relations are beginning to be integrated in such programs as health, planning and housing programs of a few major municipalities like Toronto, Vancouver and Montreal.

4.2 THE FCM RACE RELATIONS PROGRAM

FCM has played an important role in increased race relations initiatives at the municipal level. In pursuit of its objective of promoting institutional change and improved race relations, FCM has undertaken a number of actions:

i **"How To" Manuals**

Over 27,000 copies of the three "How To" manuals have been distributed to municipalities, school boards, police forces, public libraries, racial and ethnocultural community organizations and others.

ii **March 21: International Day for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination**

FCM's vigorous promotion of March 21, the International Day for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination has resulted in 41 municipalities out of 53 in the survey, or 77.4 % of the total who participate in this event.

iii **National and Regional Symposia**

Two National Symposia one in 1986 and another in 1989, and a Regional Symposium in 1990 organized by the FCM provided an excellent forum for exchange of ideas and information to municipal officials, racial minority community members, institutional representatives and federal and provincial governments.

iv **Policy on Municipal Race Relations**

FCM adopted a policy resolution on municipal race relations at its 1984 Annual Conference and subsequently established a five-member Task Force on Race Relations.

To implement this policy, FCM commissioned a study of municipal race relation initiatives in Canada and formed a Technical Advisory Committee in 1985.

v **A Resource Kit**

In 1986, FCM developed a Resource Kit on Municipal Initiatives in Multiculturalism and Race Relations.

vi **The National Action Committee**

At the 1986 Annual Conference, FCM approved a Policy Statement "Improving Race Relations in Canadian Municipalities."

To implement this policy, FCM established the National Action Committee on Race Relations.

Unlike other FCM Standing Committees, this committee includes racial minority community members in addition to municipal officials.

vii **Publications**

The FCM FORUM regularly carries articles and news items on race relations to FCM member municipalities 6 to 8 times a year.

A brochure, "A Changing Society: Local Government and Community/Race Relations", and other material has been published to inform and sensitize municipalities.

viii **Other Activities**

Workshops at Annual Conferences and at other times

Preparation and presentation of briefs to the Special Parliamentary Committee on Multiculturalism

Holding of consultation meetings with municipalities, community members, institutions, and others

Issuing press releases on matters of race relations concern

Developing a resource centre

Travelling by the FCM Race Relations Co-ordinator to meet and consult with municipal government officials, community members and others

Speeches and references to race relations in public addresses by FCM leaders

4.2.1 Support from Multiculturalism and Citizenship Canada

The FCM Race Relations Program is an excellent model of partnership between government and non-government organizations in embarking on institutional changes necessary to deal with the issues of multiculturalism and race relations.

From its very inception, FCM Race Relations Program has received unqualified support and encouragement from the Department of the Secretary of State (Multiculturalism and Citizenship Canada).

This support has come in a number of forms: advice and guidance from the department in the development of FCM program, presence of departmental personnel at FCM meetings and events, on-going communication between FCM and departmental staff in the implementing various aspects of the program, and, financial support provided by the department.

The impact of the government support on FCM program has been invaluable. Funding received from the department paved the way for FCM to embark on its program without having to concern itself about raising an adequate level of funding necessary for the implementation of the program. Furthermore, the support and involvement of senior departmental officers (at the level of Assistant Under Secretary of State and Director General) has provided a clear indication of the importance attached by the Federal Government to affecting institutional change in major Canadian institutions.

To be sure, there are a few people - indeed, a very few people - who have raised concern about the involvement of the federal department in the FCM program. These individuals feel that there is "too much interference" of departmental offcers. As one individual put it, FCM cannot do anything until it is "approved" by the department.

However, discussions with a vast majority of people interviewed for this study indicated that, Multiculturalism and Citizenship Canada has been playing an extremely critical role in facilitating FCM's effortss. Therefore, it is extremely important that the support of the department in form of funding and resources continue for FCM to build on the foundation which has already been built.

4.3 THE CHALLENGE IN RACE RELATIONS

Canadian municipalities, and FCM face an enormous challenge in race relations in 1990's because of increasing racial tensions in many Canadian cities.

As a result, race relations issues which were of concern to racial minority communities in 1984 are still relevant. This became apparent from the field work conducted for this study in six cities.

Interviews and meetings with numerous people in these cities suggested that the major issues of concern are:

1 Employment within Municipal Government Services

2 Policing and Enforcement of Law and Order

3 Spread of Vandalism, Graffiti, Racist Pins, Buttons and Hate Literature

4 Access to a Wide Range of Municipal Services and Institutions

5 Commitment of Elected/Appointed Municipal Officials

6 Effective Communication with Racial/Ethnic Minority Communities

The extent of concern with each one of the above issues varies from one city to another. And, there are other issues specific to a particular city (for example, the language issue in Montreal). Nevertheless, concern about the above six issues is common, in varying degrees, to every city under study.

Concerns with regard to these issues existed in 1984 when FCM began its initiatives in municipal race relations. Now, however, the intensity of racial minorities' concerns has increased.

This increase in racial tensions is not because the FCM program or municipal initiatives are ineffective, misdirected or irrelevant. Rather, it is because of a number of factors which impact on and influence race relations in municipalities: national events, demographic trends and economic conditions.

National Events: National events and trends in Canada indicate that intolerance of racial minorities is increasing. The Angus Reid-Southam poll (published in February, 1990) and the Environics poll (published in June, 1990) both reported an increase in racism and bigotry in Canada.

The most crucial race relations issue in Canada today is that of the rights and plight of the Aboriginal Peoples. In the post-Meech Lake period and in view of the crisis at Oka, the Aboriginal concerns will be central to the development of national and local policies and programs on race relations.

Other national trends and events include: incidents of vandalism, desecration of cemeteries, racist graffiti, and the spread of hate literature and materials; the backlash generated by increasing numbers of immigrants generally, and particularly entrepreneurial immigrants from Hong Kong; and, the controversy around the issue of allowing Sikhs to wear turbans as part of the RCMP uniform.

Canada is not the only country in which racial intolerance is on a rise. Similar trends are reported in the United States (as depicted in June, 1990, by a CBS television program "48 Hours"), France (as described in the Globe and Mail dated April 7, 1990 and TIME Magazine dated April 16, 1990), and other countries.

Demographics: The Canadian population is changing rapidly in its cultural and racial composition. The birth and fertility rates in Canada are among the lowest in the world and this trend is expected to continue.

Immigration patterns have changed dramatically in the last 25 years, and as a result, the bulk of newcomers to Canada are from the Third World countries of Asia, Africa, the Caribbean, and Latin and South America. In 1988, for example, over 70 % of immigrants to Canada came from these countries.

This has resulted in noticeable increases of members of Visible Minorities in Canada. According to the 1986 Census, Visible Minorities were 6.3 % of Canada's population. This segment of our population is expected to reach approximately 10 % by the year 2000.

Economic Conditions: Economic conditions have a significant impact on race relations. In times of economic upswing when there are enough jobs and the economy is buoyant, race relations generally tend to be tension free. In times of economic downturn, on the other hand, racial intolerance and tensions are much greater. 1990's are expected to be the years of tough economic times, and race relations in Canadian municipalities are likely to come under increased tensions.

4.4. NEED FOR A MUCH GREATER EFFORT

To face the challenge to race relations in the 1990's, municipalities and FCM will need to expend a much greater effort. A bold, pro-active approach and a well-defined plan of action must be the key ingredients of the future course of action.

The following recommendations are presented with a view to assisting FCM in determining the direction of its Race Relations Program.

4.4.1 Objectives of the FCM Race Relations Program

The main objective of the Program has been to "promote institutional change and improved race relations in local communities and municipal government."

This definition of the Program's objective has been sufficient for the FCM to undertake its activities in the past.

However, a number of survey respondents and people interviewed in the six cities as well as the current reality of race relations in Canadian cities suggest that time has come for the FCM to re-define the objectives and role of the Race Relations Program.

Recommendation 1:

That the objectives of the Program be clearly spelled out and expanded by adding:

advocacy on race relations issues

sensitization of elected and appointed municipal representatives

provision of advice and guidance to municipalities in achieving institutional change

monitoring of municipal race relations programs

facilitating resolution of race relations problems

networking with other institutions which are pursuing programs with similar objectives

In order to meet these objectives, it is further recommended:

Recommendation 2:

That the FCM Program be mandated to play a more pro-active role in meeting its objectives.

Such a role would, for example, mean that FCM, either through the Race Relations Co-ordinator or NAC approach municipalities, either individually or in clusters, for the purpose of establishing race relations committees or introducing employment equity and assisting them in working out action plans.

4.4.2 Program Structure

i. National Action Committee (NAC)

Delegates to the 1986 Annual Conference of FCM approved a Policy Statement entitled, "Improving Race Relations in Canadian Municipalities." NAC was established to help implement the Policy Statement.

Unlike other FCM Committees, NAC is comprised of both municipal representatives as well as community members. NAC members come from all five regions of Canada.

The membership of the committee has remained stable in the last four years except for a few changes. This stability has helped committee members in getting to know each other well and in dealing with matters of ongoing concern.

Since its formation, NAC has played an important role in the implementation of the FCM Race Relations Program. Indeed, NAC has been instrumental in setting the agenda for the FCM's Program.

However, at present Aboriginal Peoples are not represented on NAC. Similarly, there is no youth representation to present their perspective. And, there is only one visible minority woman on NAC.

Furthermore, because of the large areas covered by each of the five regions, NAC, and by extension, FCM appear to be too far removed from a number of local municipalities and communities.

Accordingly, it is recommended:

Recommendation 3:

That the structure and membership of the National Action Committee be reviewed to include:

representation from the Aboriginal Peoples' communities and youth.

Recommendation 4:

That in appointing the above members, particular attention be given to increasing female representation.

Recommendation 5:

That Regional sub-committees of NAC be established in five regions to cater specifically to regional concerns.

That in appointing members on Regional Sub-Committees, knowledge of municipal operations should be an important criterion.

ii. FCM Race Relations Co-ordinator

As a member of FCM staff, the Race Relations Co-ordinator reports to the Research Director, who in turn, reports to the FCM Executive Director.

One of the concerns raised by several people interviewed in conducting the case studies was that the presence of the FCM Race Relations Co-ordinator is needed in the field to provide guidance and advice. Contacts through telephone and mail are not always satisfactory to deal with complex race relations issues.

Another concern relates to the workload which leaves very little, if any time for the Co-ordinator to perform tasks other than those which are immediate. The development and operation of an effective resource centre, for example, would require much greater attention and time of the Co-ordinator than what is available at present.

Furthermore, if FCM is to assume a proactive role, it will need adequate human resources. The present staff complement will not be sufficient.

Accordingly, it is recommended:

Recommendation 6:

That the staff complement of the FCM Race Relations Program be increased to assist the Race Relations Co-ordinator.

iii. FCM Board of Directors

Some concerns have been expressed that the FCM Board of Directors is not sensitive enough to race relations issues. This has resulted in apparent low priority given to these matters by the Board. It has been suggested that the Board be more sensitized on race relations.

Accordingly, it is recommended:

Recommendation 7:

That consideration be given to ways and means of sensitizing the FCM Board of Directors more regularly about race relations issues.

Recommendation 8:

That race relations and multicultural dimensions be integrated in the work of other FCM Standing Committees (such as the Standing Committees on Heritage, Art and Culture, Economic Development, and Housing) through a closer liaison between NAC and other committees.

4.4.3 Program Activities

Many suggestions were made by survey respondents, and municipal officials and community members interviewed with regard to activities which might be undertaken by the FCM Race Relations Program in meeting its objectives.

Recommendations for expanding and re-defining the objectives of the Program suggest that, in addition to continuing present initiatives, there is a need for the FCM to provide a more targeted, more concentrated focus on major areas.

The following recommendations for program activities are deal with these areas: communication and networking, advocacy, assistance and guidance, building on present initiatives, and a plan of action.

A Communication and Networking

At present, the major elements of the communication strategy of the FCM Program are: articles and news items in the FORUM, media releases, publication of brochures, national and regional symposia, and meetings and contacts with visible minority/ethnic community organizations.

Every issue of the FCM FORUM contains some material on race relations. Concerns are expressed, however, that articles and news items on race relations seem to be buried in a publication which covers a whole host of other matters of interest to FCM members.

Two national symposia and one regional symposium have been useful in providing a forum for exchange of information and ideas and networking. National symposia have their place, but they do not provide opportunities to focus specifically on concerns of a region or on a specific issue.

Furthermore, community organization in all six cities had concerns about a lack of information about the FCM Program. It is true that FCM cannot and should not be expected to communicate with hundreds of community organizations which exist across Canada. However, there is room for improving communication with national ethnocultural organizations.

In view of these findings it is recommended:

Recommendation 9:

That a newsletter on municipal race relations, distributed quarterly, be published by FCM.

That persons knowledgeable about race relations in the municipal context be invited to write articles in the proposed newsletter.

This newsletter should be distributed to the FCM member municipalities, municipal race relations committee members, senior managers of municipal government departments, national ethnocultural organizations, police departments, school boards, public libraries, municipal government employees' unions, and national business and labour organizations.

Recommendation 10:

That a greater use be made of the ethnic media in publicizing the FCM and municipal initiatives in race relations.

Recommendation 11:

That two regional symposia be held every year to focus specifically on the issues of regional concern.

Regional sub-committees recommended earlier would provide ideas, support and people to assist in organizing such symposia.

Recommendation 12:

That working sessions on specific aspect of municipal services like employment equity and contract compliance, health, housing, public works, planning, parks and recreation, and economic development be held to focus on specific issues.

Recommendation 13:

That similar working sessions be held on issues of concerns to Aboriginal and racial minority women, youth and seniors.

These working sessions would be "no-frills" meetings of municipal officials and community members with experience and expertise on specific areas. The objective would be to provide a forum for an exchange of information from a hands-on perspective. Reports from such sessions could form guidelines for municipal action.

These sessions could also help in expanding the base of FCM's Program by involving people who otherwise would not be involved in the FCM activities.

Recommendation 14:

That contacts and communication with ethnocultural communities be improved through networking with national ethnocultural organizations.

These contacts could take a number forms: appearances at annual gatherings, exhibiting and distributing material about the FCM and municipal initiatives; participating in Race Relations Committee of the Canadian Ethnocultural Council; ongoing contacts with the Urban Alliance of Canada in Toronto, the Centre for Research-Action on Race Relations in Montreal, and the Committee on Racial Justice in Vancouver; and, providing material on municipal initiatives for publication in newsletters of national organizations.

Recommendation 15:

That ongoing communication be initiated with other national institutions (e.g. the Canadian Labour Congress, Canadian Bankers Association, Canadian Chamber of Commerce, etc.) pursuing objectives similar to those of the FCM Program.

A number of national institutions are involved in pursuing institutional change and other objectives similar to those of the FCM Race Relations Program. Ongoing networking with these organizations could provide valuable information, assist in minimizing possible duplication of efforts, and help in learning from each others' experience.

Recommendation 16:

That actions be initiated with municipal officials in selected cities in other countries (e.g. New York, Chicago, Los Angeles, London, Paris, Bonn,etc.) to exchange information on their programs on race relations.

As noted earlier, a number of western countries are experiencing increased racial intolerance and tensions. It would be useful for the FCM to exchange information and ideas with major cities in these countries to learn from their experience. Such contacts could lead to a gathering of officials from major Canadian cities with those from other countries.

B Advocacy

There is no reference to advocacy in the statement of objectives of the FCM Race Relations Program. However, through a number of its activities, FCM is involved in an advocacy role to some extent.

Suggestions made by a number of survey respondents and people interviewed in the six cities lead to the conclusion that it is time for the FCM to assume a more pro-active advocacy role.

Accordingly, it is recommended:

Recommendation 17:

That advocacy on race relations issues be specifically added as a stated objective of the FCM Race Relations Program.

An active pursuit of this objective would involve the FCM, through NAC, the FCM President, or through its Board of Directors, in taking public positions on issues such as vandalism, desecration of cemeteries, racist graffiti, spread of hate literature and material, backlash against entrepreneurial Asian immigrants, and, the issue of allowing Sikhs to wear turbans in the RCMP.

Active advocacy by FCM would also allow FCM to approach individual municipalities on issues such as employment equity and contract compliance, establishment of race/community relations committees, appointments of racial/ethnic minority members on municipal boards and commissions, public education programs, etc.

C Assistance and Guidance to Municipalities

FCM endeavours to assist and guide municipalities, especially those which are beginning to initiate race relations programs. However, limitations of available resources impose restrictions on how far the FCM can go. Yet, many survey respondents and a number of interviewees in the six cities expressed a need for a greater communication with the FCM.

To be sure, FCM cannot possibly attempt to assist every municipality through personal visits by the Race Relations Co-ordinator. This is where the regional sub-committees' concept could provide valuable support to FCM. Also, an increase in the staff complement of the FCM Program as recommended earlier would help.

In addition, it is recommended:

Recommendation 18:

That, once a year, the FCM Race Relations Co-ordinator meet with municipal officials responsible for dealing with race relations issues in every region either at regional or national gatherings.

The purpose of such meetings would be for municipal officials to communicate their concerns to and seek guidance from the FCM Race Relations Co-ordinator in person. Such meetings could be held as a part of the regional symposia recommended earlier.

Recommendation 19:

That the FCM prepare an inventory of resource people in municipalities/community organizations who could assist and guide municipalities, especially smaller municipalities with limited resources, in specific areas of concern.

A number of municipalities have already gained considerable experience in specific subject-areas, and they have people with the expertise necessary to assist other municipalities in their regions. Similarly, there are community members in a number of cities with the necessary expertise.

For example, Mary Bruce in Toronto has tremendous experience in employment equity and contract compliance and Joseph Sasvari in Vancouver has valuable expertise in culturally appropriate and sensitive health service. FCM should explore avenues to enlist their support in assisting other municipalities in these areas.

Furthermore, concerns have been expressed in a number of cities that members of the City Council and/or senior municipal bureaucrats are often not sensitive to race relations issues. As a result, actions on race relations do not take a priority. For any meaningful progress in municipal race relations, it is essential that people who make decisions on municipal programs must have a good understanding of the issues.

Therefore, it is recommended:

Recommendation 20:

That the FCM take steps to sensitize City Council members and senior municipal bureaucrats of municipalities, where necessary.

D Building on Present Initiatives

The "How To" manuals published and distributed by the FCM have proved to be the most useful of present FCM initiatives. There are a number of other issues on which such "How To" manuals could be very valuable.

FCM can also be a very effective clearing house of resource material and information.

Therefore, it is recommended:

Recommendation 21:

That "How To" manuals be published on such matters as:

- networking with racial and Aboriginal communities at the local levels
- race relations in public libraries and other local institutions-the institutional change process and mechanisms necessary to achieve it
- concerns of women, youth and seniors

Recommendation 22:

That "How To" manuals be distributed to national ethnocultural organizations.

Recommendation 23:

That the resource centre be augmented with more space, material, and staff time so that the FCM could play the role of a clearing house of information and ideas more effectively.

One of the facts that emerged in conducting this study was that in Canada, not much research has been conducted in the field of municipal race relations. The resource centre could become a catalyst for carrying out of research studies to assist FCM and its member municipalities. And, FCM could secure funding for and sponsor studies on such subjects as institutional change in municipal governments.

E A Plan of Action

In order for the FCM to be effective in carrying out its objectives and mandate, it will be essential that a plan of action with a strategy be developed.

Such a plan would focus specifically on certain initiatives such as race relations committees, employment equity/contract compliance, access to municipal services and training.

As well, the plan would contain strategies to deal with the race relations concerns of smaller municipalities and with issues related specifically to women, youth and seniors.

It is recommended:

Recommendation 24:

That a plan of action with a strategy be developed to achieve improvements in the following areas:

race relations committees
employment equity/contract compliance
access to municipal services
race relations and cross-cultural training

Recommendation 25:

That the plan of action provide special consideration to deal with the concerns of:

smaller municipalities, and
racial minority women, youth and seniors.

FEDERATION OF CANADIAN MUNICIPALITIES

ASSESSMENT OF MUNICIPAL RACE/ETHNIC RELATIONS PROGRAM

QUESTIONNAIRE

This questionnaire is divided into two parts: PART I requests your input on Race/Ethnic Relations programs, policies and plans of your municipality; and, PART II solicits your feedback specifically on the Race Relations Program of the Federation of Canadian Municipalities.

It is recognized that all respondents may not have information for all of the questions. Please answer those questions to which you are able to respond. If a question does not apply to you in your position, simply write N/A. It is our objective to collect information from a number of different viewpoints. Therefore, PLEASE ANSWER THIS QUESTIONNAIRE AS FULLY AS YOU CAN. IT WILL TAKE NO MORE THAN 20 MINUTES.

The DEADLINE for return is **JUNE 1, 1990.**

RESPONDENT INFORMATION

Name (PLEASE PRINT):_____
First Last

Address: _____

_____

Postal Code

Phone No.: __(__)__ - ____ (work) __(__)__ - ____
(res.)

Fax No.: __(__)__ - ____

Identification: Are you a representative of (PLEASE CHECK APPROPRIATE CATEGORY):.

1	Municipal Government:	_____
2	Visible Minority/Ethnic Community/Organization	__(please specify)
3	Municipal Race/Ethnic Relations Committee:	_____
4	Provincial/Territorial/Reg. Municipal Association:	_____
5	Human Rights Commission:	_____
6	Provincial/Territorial Government Department:	__ (please specify)
7	Federal Govt. Department:	___(please specify)
8	Other:	___(please specify)

PART I: **RACE/ETHNIC RELATIONS PROGRAMS, POLICIES AND PLANS**

A RACE/ETHNIC RELATIONS COMMITTEE

1 to Does your municipality have a committee whose objective is improve and achieve harmonious race and ethnic relations ?

Yes: ____ No: ____ Don't Know: ____

IF YES, answer questions 2 to 14.
IF NO, go to question 15.

2 If there is a committee, is it an ad hoc committee/working group or an ongoing committee ?

Ad hoc: ____ Ongoing: ____ Other: _____
please specify

3 If the committee in your municipality is an ongoing committee,

a) When was it formed ? Year: 19___

b) What led to its formation ? (PLEASE CHECK)

i) a specific incident: _____

ii) citizen advocacy: _____

iii) municipal initiative: _____

iv) FCM manuals/symposium: _____

v) other (please specify): _____

4 What type of committee is it ? (PLEASE CHECK)

Committee of:

i) Council Representatives: _____

ii) Only Ethnic/Visible Minority Members: _____

iii) Institutionally-based: _____

iv) Other (please specify): _____

v) A combination of the above: _____
(please indicate combination)

5 What is the composition of this committee ?

a) Total No. of Committee Members: _____

b) No. of elected Municipal Govt. Representatives or officials: _____

c) No. of Visible Minority/Ethnic Community Members: _____

d) No. of Other Members: _____

e) Committee chaired by: i) Municipal Official: _____
ii) Community Representative: _____
iii) Another Member: _____
(please specify)

6 Is there a paid coordinator for the committee ?

Yes: ____ No: ____ Don't know: ____

a) If yes, is the coordinator:

Full-time: _____ Part-time: _____ ?

b) Who is coordinator paid by ?

i) Federal Government: _____

ii) Provincial Government: _____

iii) Municipal Government: _____

iv) Other source (please specify) _____

v) More than one source: _____
(please specify contribution)

7 Is there a budget allocation for the committee ?

Yes: ____ No: ____ Don't know: ____

a) IF YES, what is the approximate budget for the current year ?

i) Less than $5,000 _____

ii) Between $5,000 - $15,000 _____

iii) Between $15,000 - $25,000 _____

(Continued on p.4.)

iv) Between $25,000 - $50,000 _____

v) More than $50,000 _____

vi) Don't know: _____

8 How often does the committee meet ?

Monthly: ___ Bi-monthly: ___ Quarterly: ___

Other: ___ (please specify)

9 Are the committee meetings public ? Yes: ____ No: _____

10 Has the committee established any sub-committees ?

Yes: ____ No: ____

11 What is the mandate of the committee ?

_____

_____

12 What are FIVE of the most important accomplishments of the committee in your municipality? (PLEASE RANK IN ORDER OF IMPORTANCE)

1 _____

2 _____

3 _____

4 _____

5 _____

Please attach a copy of the most recent committee report.

13 Do members of your committee sit on:

i) Municipal Grants Committees: _____

ii) Personnel/Hiring Boards: _____

iii) Parks/Recreation Planning Committees: _____

iv) Public Works Allocations: _____

v) Special Projects/Events Boards: _____

vi) Other(please specify): _____

14 How would you rate the effectiveness of the committee in your municipality in each of the following areas? (PLEASE CIRCLE ONE NUMBER)

	Very effective			Not effective
i) Sensitization about Ethnic/ Race Relations Issues:	4	3	2	1
ii) Introduction of Employment Equity:	4	3	2	1
iii) Minority Access to Municipal Services:	4	3	2	1
iv) Policing:	4	3	2	1
v) Media and Public Relations:	4	3	2	1
vi) Other(please specify):	4	3	2	1

Comments: _____

_____

_____

_____

15 If there is no ongoing committee in your municipality, are there plans to form such a committee ?

Yes: ____ No: ____ Don't know: ____

Please attach any relevant material.

B **MUNICIPAL POLICY**

1 Does your municipality have a policy aimed at improving race/ethnic relations ?

Yes: ____ No: ____ Don't know: ____

IF NO, answer question 4

IF YES, what is the name of the policy ?

_____

2 IF YES, when was the policy developed ? Year: 19____

Please attach a copy of the policy.

3 To which of the following groups is the policy made known ?

i) Visible Minority/Ethnic Communities: _____

ii) Municipal workers: _____

iii) Municipal managers: _____

iv) Community at large: _____

4 If there is no policy in effect, are there any plans to develop a policy ?

Yes: ____ No: ____ Don't know: ____

C **COMMUNITY OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATION**

1 Does your municipality have an outreach program/plan for visible/ethnic minority communities ?

Yes: ____ No: ____ Don't know: ____

If yes, please give details or attach material.

_____

_____

2 Is there a multicultural/immigrant services centre in your municipality ?

Yes: ____ No: ____ Don't know: ____

IF YES, in what ways does the municipality contribute to its running?

i) Financial Support: _____

ii) Staffing: _____

iii) Materials and Equipment: _____

iv) Building/Space: _____

v) Other (please specify): _____

3 Does your municipality maintain an up-to-date list of ethnic minority community organizations ?

Yes: ____ No: ____ Don't know: ____

4 Does your municipality provide financial assistance to visible minority/ethnic community organizations ?

Yes: ____ No: ____ Don't know: ____

5 Does your municipality provide interpretation/translation services to visible minority/ethnic communities?

Yes: ____ No: ____ Don't know: ____

6 Does your municipality advertise in ethnic newsletters and papers ?

Yes: ____ No: ____ Don't know: ____

7 How does your municipality participate in March 21: The International Day for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination ?

i) Mayor's Proclamation: _____

ii) Organize Events: _____

iii) Attend Events: _____

iv) Provide Financial Support: _____

v) Other (please specify): _____

8 and What other ethnic and visible minority community outreach communication activities has your municipality undertaken ? (PLEASE CHECK WHERE APPLICABLE)

Posters: _____ Proclamations: _____

Street Names: ___ Civic Symbols: _____

Recognition Awards: _____ Exhibitions: _____

Other: (please specify): _____

D **ACCESS AND EMPLOYMENT**

1 Does your municipality have a program to provide greater access to municipal services for visible/ ethnic minorities ?

Yes: ____ No: ____ Don't know: ____

a) IF YES, please give details or attach material.

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

b) To what extent has the Race Relations Committee in your municipality been involved in this matter ?

Very Involved Not Involved

4 3 2 1

PLEASE EXPLAIN:_____

_____

2 Has your municipality undertaken a survey of visible minority and Aboriginal Peoples' representation in its workforce ?

Yes: ____ No: ____ Don't know: ____

3 Has your municipality introduced an Employment Equity program ?

Yes: ____ No: ____ Don't know: ____

IF YES, when was the program introduced ? Year: 19____

4 In addition to measures taken as part of the employment equity program, is special consideration being given to visible minority and Aboriginal women ?

Yes: _____ No: _____ Don't know: _____

IF YES, please give details: _____

_____

_____

F **EDUCATION AND TRAINING**

1 Has your municipality organized public forums, workshops or conferences on race and ethnic relations ?

Yes: ____ No: ____ Don't know: ____

2 Does your municipality conduct cross-cultural or race relations training for its staff and/or managers ?

Yes: ____ No: ____ Don't know: ____

IF YES, please indicate the kind of training programs:

i) Sensitization and Awareness Sessions: _____

ii) Anti-racist Education: _____

iii) Human Rights Training: _____

iv) Cross-cultural Communication: _____

v) Managing Diversity: _____

vi) Serving a Diverse Community: _____

vii) General Information Sessions: _____

viii) Other(please specify): _____

PART II. FCM RACE RELATIONS PROGRAM AND INITIATIVES

1 Are you familiar with the FCM Race Relations Program and Initiatives ?

Yes _____ Somewhat _____ Very little _____ No _____

2 If you are at all familiar with the FCM program initiatives, please indicate how useful you have found the following: (PLEASE CIRCLE ONE NUMBER)

		Very useful			Not useful
a)	"How TO" Manuals:				
	i) "Getting Started"	4	3	2	1
	ii) "Dealing with Diversity"	4	3	2	1
b)	March 1989 National Symposium: "Building Partnerships in Race Relations"	4	3	2	1
c)	Relevant articles and news items in the FORUM	4	3	2	1
d)	Contacts with and communication from FCM Race Relations Office	4	3	2	1
e)	Contacts and communication from FCM National Action Committee on Race Relations (NACRR)	4	3	2	1
f)	Promotion of March 21: International Day for Elimination of Racial Discrimination	4	3	2	1

3 To what extent have FCM initiatives (for example, the "how to" manuals, the National Symposium, etc.) influenced the following actions taken or planned by your municipality ?

		Strongly			Not at all
i)	Race Relations Committee:	4	3	2	1
ii)	Race/Ethnic Relations Policy:	4	3	2	1
iii)	Outreach Program:	4	3	2	1
iv)	March 21 Events:	4	3	2	1
v)	Access to Municipal Services:	4	3	2	1
vi)	Introduction of Employment Equity:	4	3	2	1
vii)	Workshops/Seminars/Conferences:	4	3	2	1
viii)	Training for Staff/Managers:	4	3	2	1
ix)	Police-Minority Relations Program:	4	3	2	1
x)	Other (please specify)	4	3	2	1

4 How can current FCM initiatives be improved to be of more assistance to you in recognizing and dealing with racial and cultural diversity ?

_____

_____

_____

5 To assist FCM, what suggestions do you have for FCM to initiate new activities/programs ?

_____

_____

_____

Do you have any other comments to make ?

THANK YOU FOR YOUR COOPERATION

APPENDIX 2/1

FCM SURVEY

QUESTIONNAIRE DISTRIBUTION AND RESPONSES BY IDENTIFICATION

Recipients/Respondents	Distribution No.	Responses No.	Rate of Return %
Municipal Governments	115	53	46.1
Mun. Race Rel. Committees	36	4	8.3
Visible Minority/Ethnic Community Organizations	63	9	12.7
Other (including Institutional Representatives)	50	7	22.0
Additional Mun. Responses	--	3	--
Total:	264	76	28.8

Note: Two responses arrived too late for processing. Not included in the above total.

APPENDIX 2/2

FCM SURVEY RESPONDENTS BY PROVINCE, MUNICIPALITY AND IDENTIFICATION

	Total Resp.	Mun. Govt.	Comm. Org.	Race Rel. Committee	Inst'l Reps.
British Columbia	12	12			
Burnaby	1	1 (1)			
Chilliwak	1	1			
Clearbrook	1	1			
Coquitlam	1	1			
Delta	1	1			
Kamloops	1	1 (1)			
New Westminster	1	1			
N. Vancouver	1	1			
Prince George	1	1 (1)			
Saanich (Dist.)	1	1			
Surrey	1	1			
Vancouver	1	1			
Alberta	7	5			2
Calgary	2	1			1
Edmonton	2	1			1
Ft. McMurray	1	1			
Red Deer	1	1			
Strathcona Cnty.	1	1			
Saskatchewan	5	2	3		
Prince Albert	1		1		
Regina	3	1	2		
Saskatoon	1	1			
Manitoba	1	1			
Winnipeg	1	1 (1)			

contd....

	Total Resp.	Mun. Govt.	Comm. Org.	Race Rel. Committee	Inst'l Reps.
Ontario	36	26	4	3	3
Aurora	1		1		
Barrie	1	1			
Brampton	1	1			
Brantford	1	1			
Cambridge	1	1			
Cornwall	1	1			
East York	1	1			
Etobicoke	1	1			
Haldi-Norfolk Reg. Mun.	1	1			
Halton Hills (Georgetown)	1	1			
Hamilton	3	1 (1)		1	1
Kingston	1	1			
Kitchener	1	1			
London	1	1			
Metro Toronto	1	1			
Nepean	1		1		
Ott-Carl.R.Mun.	1	1			
Ottawa	3	1		1	1
Peterborough	1	1			
Scarborough	1	1			
Stoney Creek	1	1			
Sudbury	1	1			1
Thorold	1	1			
Thunder Bay	1	1			
Toronto	4	*2 (1)	1	1	
Windsor	2	1	1 (1)		
Quebec	10	6	2	1	1
Hull	1	1			
Laval	1	1			
Montreal	5	*3	1		1
Outremont	1			1	
Quebec City	1		1		
Sherbrooke	1	1			

contd...

	Total Resp.	Mun. Govt.	Comm. Org.	Race Rel. Committee	Inst'l Reps.
New Brunswick	1	1			
Fredericton	1	1			
Nova Scotia	3	2			1
Halifax	1				
Halifax County	2	1			1
Newfoundland	1	1			
St. John's	1	1			
Total:	76	56	9	4	7

Asterisk (*) indicates municipalities from which more than one municipal official returned questionnaires

(1): Municipal Government respondents are also identified on Race Relations Committees

APPENDIX 2/3

FCM SURVEY RECIPIENTS AND RESPONDENTS BY PROVINCE

	Recipients No.	% of Total	Respondents No.	% of Total
British Columbia	34	12.9	12	15.8
Alberta	13	4.9	7	9.2
Saskatchewan	16	6.0	5	6.6
Manitoba	4	1.5	1	1.3
Ontario	130	49.2	36	47.4
Quebec	45	17.0	10	13.2
New Brunswick	3	1.1	1	1.3
Nova Scotia	15	5.7	3	4.0
Prince Edward Island	1	0.4	-	-
Newfoundland	1	0.4	1	1.3
Yukon	1	0.4	-	-
Northwest Territories	1	0.4	-	-
Total:	264	100.0	76	100.0

ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF RACE RELATIONS COMMITTEES

Question 12 in Part 1 of the survey questionnaire asked respondents: What are FIVE of the most important accomplishments of the committee in your municipality ? (Please rank in order of importance)

The following are some examples of accomplishments indicated by respondents in answer to question 12 in Part IA of the FCM survey questionnaire: What are FIVE of the most important accomplishments of the committee in your municipality ?

1. A Municipal Govt.Representative

- proposal leading to anti-discrimination legislation for City restaurants, hotels, etc.
- support of EEO programs toward representative hiring etc.
- meetings with media regarding racism and race relations.
- anti-racist graffiti policy and involvement in coordinating committee to deal with this issue.
- coordination of HATE literature sub-committee - involvement with community and Vancouver Police Department.

2. A Municipal Govt. Representative

- Chief David Crowchild Memorial Award, annually
- Needs assessment study of urban aboriginals
- Initiation of Native Liaison Program, Social Services Dept.
- Addressing of education, employment, training and child welfare issues
- Support and advocacy of native initiatives in fields of education, social services, justice, etc.

3. A Coordinator of a Municipal Community and Race Rel. Committee

- removal of discriminatory practice in the Police Dept.
- major public education programs
- lobbied for more visible minorities on Boards and Commissions
- Changes in the EEOP Program
- closer working relationship with the Native Community

contd..

4. A Member of Community Organization who is also on the Race Relations Committee

- revision of the Hiring policy in the City of Windsor
- establishing the fact that there are systematic barriers in Municipal Institution
- development of recommendations to correct existing barriers
- request and receipt of a statement from City Counsel denouncing Neo-Nazi Activities by skinheads.

5. A Municipal Govt. Representative

- development of Multiculturalism Policy
- development of Anti-Apartheid Policy
- focus on Employment Phase 1 and 2
- input of Committee on City's programs and services
- commenting on issues such as policing, Meech Lake

6. A Municipal Govt. Representative

- forum for discussion and resolution on visible minority concerns.
- a community base for a network of better racial harmony.
- promotion of better race relations through workshops, seminars, conferences.
- mediation of individual racial conflict issues.
- helped to initiate Race Relations Committee at Board of Education and Police Force.

7. A Race Relations Committee Chair

- survey of visible minorities in city govt. departments
- City Council approval of Race Relations Policy
- approval of Employment Equity Policy
- approval of Provincial Police Act
- approval of support for conferences, seminars, etc.

8. A Municipal Govt. Representative

- establishment of Contract Compliance
- year for Racial Harmony program
- establishment of Aboriginal Health Scholarships
- establishment of Chinese and S.E. Asian Legal Clinic
- conference on Contributions of Immigrants and Refugees to Canada

contd..

9. A Race Relations Committee Member

- contract compliance
- internal employment equity
- multicultural access programs
- police minority issues advocacy
- advocacy with respect to racist community relations issues.

10. A Community Organization

- study on who gets the work
- study on "no discrimination here"
- ongoing work with the Ministry of Citizenship
- ongoing work with the Board of Education
- ongoing work in the area of Employment Equity

11. A Race Relations Committee Member

- meet diverse ethnic groups to learn their habits and customs
- relieve tensions between ethnics
- elaborate a declaration concerning non-discrimination and equality
- familiarize our existence and our work to colleagues
- abide by our rules and procedures

12. A Municipal Govt. Representatives

- declaration of Montreal against racial discrimination
- program of equality for cultural communities
- training program on the reality of cultural communities
- communication program with cultural communities
- creation of Consultative committee on intercultural and interracial relations in Montreal

EFFECTIVENESS OF MUNICIPAL RACE/ETHNIC RELATIONS COMMITTEES

Question 14 in Part 1 of the survey questionnaire asked the respondents to indicate the effectiveness of their committees in five specific areas.

They were asked to indicate effectiveness on a scale from 4 (very effective) to 1 (not effective).

The findings are expressed in percentage of all respondents who reported existence of a committee in their municipality. There were a total of 41 respondents who reported on 27 municipal committees (as there was more than one respondent from a number of municipalities). The following are the responses of these 41 respondents.

		Committee Effectiveness				
		Very effective		Not effective		No
Response		4 %	3 %	2 %	1 %	%
i)	Sensitization:	14.6	43.9	12.2	-	29.2
ii)	Employment Equity:	14.6	43.9	12.2	-	29.2
iii)	Minority Access:	14.6	31.7	17.1	4.9	31.7
iv)	Policing:	17.1	29.2	14.6	2.4	36.6
v)	Media & PR:	12.2	31.7	19.5	4.9	31.7
Average:		14.6	36.6	14.6	2.4	31.7

High Effectiveness: 51.2 %

Low effectiveness: 14.6 %

No effectiveness: 2.4 %

Note: Figures represent percentages of all responses (56 municipal government respondents plus 20 other respondents including community organizations, race relations committees, and institutional representatives).

FAMILIARITY WITH FCM RACE RELATIONS PROGRAM

Part 2, Question 1 asked the following question:

Are you familiar with the FCM Race Relations Program and Initiatives ?

Yes _____ Somewhat _____ Very little _____ No _____

Survey Results are tabulated by respondent identification

Mun Gov (56 municipal government respondents
Oth Res (20 other respondents including 9 community organizations, 4 race relations committees and 7 institutional representatives)
All Res (76 total respondents combined)

Familiarity

		Yes	Somewhat	Little	No	No Resp.
Mun Gov:	#	25	12	10	7	2
	%	44.6	21.4	17.9	12.5	3.6
Oth Res:	#	3	10	3	3	1
	%	15.0	50.0	15.0	15.0	5.0
All Res:	#	28	22	13	10	3
	%	36.8	29.0	17.1	13.2	4.0

Some degree of familiarity: 82.9 %

USEFULNESS OF FCM PROGRAM INITIATIVES

Part 2, Question 2 asked the respondents:

If you are at all familiar with the FCM program initiatives, please indicate how useful you have found the following: (please circle one number)

		Usefulness				
		Very useful 4 %	3 %	2 %	Not useful 1 %	No Res. %
"How To" Manuals						
"Getting Started":	Mun Gov	30.3	23.2	1.8	5.4	39.3
	Oth Res	20.0	5.0	15.0	10.0	50.0
	All Res	27.6	18.4	5.3	6.6	42.1
"Dealing w. Div."	Mun Gov	30.3	25.0	1.8	5.4	37.5
	Oth Res	15.0	15.0	5.0	10.0	55.0
	All Res	26.3	22.4	2.6	6.6	42.1
March 1989 Symp.:	Mun Gov	19.6	17.9	3.6	5.4	51.8
	Oth Res	25.0	30.0	10.0	10.0	30.0
	All Res	21.1	21.1	5.3	6.6	46.0
FORUM Art./News:	Mun Gov	8.9	30.4	14.3	3.6	42.9
	Oth Res	-	15.0	20.0	10.0	55.0
	All Res	6.6	26.3	15.8	5.3	46.0
RR Office Comm. & Contacts						
	Mun Gov	7.1	21.4	14.3	7.1	50.0
	Oth Res	10.0	5.0	25.0	15.0	45.0
	All Res	7.9	17.1	17.1	9.2	48.7
NAC Contacts/Comm.:	Mun Gov	14.3	14.3	7.1	10.7	53.6
	Oth Res	5.0	-	20.0	20.0	55.0
	All Res	11.8	10.5	10.5	13.2	54.0

contd....

		Very useful 4 %	3 %	2 %	Not useful 1 %	No Res. %
Promotion of Mar.21:	Mun Gov	14.3	21.4	5.4	10.7	48.2
	Oth Res	15.0	10.0	20.0	5.0	50.0
	All Res	14.5	18.4	9.2	9.2	48.7
Average for 6 initiatives:	All Res	14.5	18.4	9.2	9.2	48.7

Some degree of usefulness: 42.1 %

Not useful: 9.2 %

Note: Percentages are based on a total of:

56 Mun Gov (municipal government respondents
20 Oth Res (other respondents including community organizations, race relations committees and institutional representatives)
76 All Res (all respondents combined)

APPENDIX 2/8

INFLUENCE OF FCM PROGRAM

Part 2, Question 3 asked the respondents:

To what extent have FCM initiatives (for example, the "how to" manuals, the National Symposium, etc.) influenced the following actions taken or planned by your municipality ?

		Strong influence 4 %	3 %	No influence 2 %	1 %	No Res. %
Race Rel. Com.:	Mun Gov	10.7	8.9	8.9	35.7	35.7
	Oth Res	15.0	15.0	5.0	15.0	50.0
	All Res	11.8	10.5	7.9	30.3	39.5
Race/Ethnic Rel.Pol:						
	Mun Gov	10.7	12.5	5.4	32.1	39.3
	Oth Res	10.0	20.0	-	15.0	55.0
	All Res	10.5	14.5	4.0	27.6	43.4
Outreach Pgrms:	Mun Gov	8.9	10.7	-	39.3	41.1
	Oth Res	5.0	20.0	-	20.0	55.0
	All Res	7.9	13.2	-	34.2	44.7
March 21:	Mun Gov	12.5	21.4	-	28.6	37.5
	Oth Res	15.0	15.0	-	15.0	55.0
	All Res	13.2	19.7	-	25.0	42.1
Acc.to Mun.Ser:	Mun Gov	10.7	16.1	1.8	30.4	41.1
	Oth Res	-	30.0	5.0	10.0	55.0
	All Res	7.9	19.7	2.6	25.0	44.7
Employ. Equity:	Mun Gov	14.3	8.9	1.8	34.0	41.1
	Oth Res	5.0	15.0	5.0	20.0	55.0
	All Res	11.8	10.5	2.6	30.3	44.7

contd....

		Strong influence 4 %	3 %	No influence 2 %	1 %	No Res. %
Workshops/Sem/Con:	Mun Gov	14.3	16.1	1.8	28.6	39.3
	Oth Res	15.0	15.0	-	10.0	60.0
	All Res	14.5	15.8	1.3	23.7	44.7
Training Staff/Mgt:	Mun Gov	10.7	14.3	1.8	30.4	42.8
	Oth Res	-	20.0	5.0	15.0	60.0
	All Res	7.9	15.8	2.6	26.3	47.4
Police-Min. Rel.:	Mun Gov	10.7	7.1	1.8	30.4	50.0
	Oth Res	10.0	-	-	25.0	65.0
	All Res	10.5	5.3	1.3	29.0	54.0
Average for 9 actions:	All Res	10.7	13.9	2.5	27.9	45.0

Some degree of influence: 27.1 %

No influence: 27.9 %

Note: Percentages are based on a total of:

56 Mun Gov (municipal government respondents
20 Oth Res (other respondents including community organizations, race relations committees and institutional representatives)
76 All Res (all respondents combined)

RESPONDENTS' RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVING THE CURRENT FCM PROGRAM AND INTRODUCING NEW INITIATIVES

Survey respondents were asked these two questions:

> Part 2, Question 4: How can current FCM initiatives be improved to be of more assistance to you in recognizing and deal with racial and cultural diversity ?
>
> Part 2, Question 5: To assist FCM, what suggestions do you have for FCM to initiate new activities/programs ?

29 respondents answered these questions. The following is a compilation of their responses:

Questionnaire # 1 (Community Organization)

Q. #4: It would be very constructive if the top level management were to be targeted as a group to be involved in a symposium where they would be working with community representatives in the issue oriented workshops on a one to one ratio.

Q. #5: The need to involve department heads and senior level management in information sharing forums and workshops is required to take our municipalities into the 90's with any hope of attitudinal change coming about.

Quest. # 31 (Municipal Government)

Q. #4: Publications/updates on demographics, immigration trends, etc. compiled in concise fashion by census areas (researched from statistics Canada data)

Quest. # 70 (Municipal Government)

Q. #4: It would be useful if FCM can organize regional meetings with municipalities and publicize its initiatives. "How To" manuals to be distributed regularly to Equal Opportunity Offices.

Q. #5: Hold either informal discussion or undertake survey as to what type of new programs would be of interest and of use for municipalities.

contd...

Quest. # 15 (Community Organization)

Q. #4: Increase financial support for program from SEC state. Have provincial municipal associations receive funding for similar program. Work with non-elected municipal officials and their unions and associations.

Q. #5: Hire more staff for program. Develop videos and displays, buttons, posters. Meet with more community ethnic organizations to drum up support.

Quest. # 60 (Other)

Q. #4: Publish more of "HOW TO" series dealing with specific issues such as employment, immigration and visible minority women, seniors, youth, translation and interpretation service.

Q. #5: There is a need for more active promotion and publicity of FCM activities and programs.

Quest. # 64 (Other)

Q. #4: The Federation has to be more actively involved in encouraging municipalities to provide more ongoing cross-cultural sensitization for staff and it has to take a stronger stand on the need for establishing employment equity policies with specific goals and timetables.

Q. #5: The FCM should initiate the development of a manual that would illustrate to municipalities how to initiate the development of an effective employment equity policy.

Quest. # 61 (Race Relations Committee)

Q. #4: There should be active involvement of local committees by annual conferences at national and provincial levels. Local committees involvement in drafting Race Relations policies, etc.

Quest. # 62 (Municipal Government)

Q. #4: More "How To" Manuals. More lead time to March 21 promotion special emphasis on native issues especially for Northern communities.

Q. #5: training directory.

contd....

Quest. # 36 (Municipal Government)

Q. #4: Provide fact sheets on communities and information on what initiatives are undertaken in other municipalities and how race relations' problems are dealt with.

Quest. # 40 (Municipal Government)

Q. #4: Continue to produce key visual documents on the subjects of multiculturalism and race relations.

Q. #5: Anti-racist organizational change.

Quest. # 53 (Municipal Government)

Q. #4: Suggest you mail information to Brantford Ethnoculturefest, 288 Murray Street Brantford, as well as similar organizations in other cities. If possible, mail 10 copies.

Q. #5: Mail a suggested resolution to all municipalities prior to March 21, suggesting proclamations relating to the International Day for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination.

Quest. # 42 (Community Organization)

Q. #4: Encourage resistant municipalities to take initiative in this issue, encourage preventative measures to minimize racial tension.

Quest. # 27 (Other)

Q. #4: Instead of a council on funding to FCM meetings. The money should be spent to support travel by Race Relations. Refs from FCM to different municipalities across Canada.

Quest. # 29 (Municipal Government)

Q. #4: The need in our Community appears to be for some organizational direction and assistance to the Race Relations Committee.

Quest. # 11 (Municipal Government)

Q. #4: Develop programs for small communities, more circulation of information to H.R. maps and directories.

contd....

Quest. # 17 (Municipal Government)

Q. #4: Materials could be more detailed and specific, especially regarding municipal services and practices. Better communications/distribution of information.

Q. #5: Have you considered the development of staff training in intercultural and race relations for emergency personnel such as: firefighters, police, ambulance workers and even including local hospital emergency room staff.

Quest. # 18 (Municipal Government)

Q. #4: FCM initiatives are adequate; lack of local initiative

Q. #5: Local workshops/seminars might be useful

Quest. # 58 (Municipal Government)

Q. #4: Municipality is just now considering a race relations committee; therefore, some time will pass before we carry regional property to this question.

Quest. # 65 (Municipal Government)

Q. #4: Focus big city issues re race relations ie, beyond beginning of how to, connect big cities on exploration of common issues - joint projects.

Quest. # 33 (Community Organization)

Q. #4: Could be more accurate to particular province because the situations are a little different.

Quest. # 59 (Community Organization)

Q. #4: _____ City Council has not done much in respect to race relations and related programs as described by FCM and SCAR, is a new non-profit organization to influence the Council.

Q. #5: There is a real need to convince Regina City Council staff for Race Relations Activities.

Quest. # 13 (Municipal Government)

Q. #4: Provide more materials to enhance training purposes, more detailed information

contd....

Q. #5: It would be beneficial to know the different agencies which are able to provide funding for training programs or general expenses of committees and networks.

Quest. # 46 (Municipal Government)

Q. #4: FCM initiatives appear excellent. It is up to us to use them more.

Quest. # 67 (Municipal Government)

Q. #4: Small communities have different needs, more limited resources, both financial and person-hours, fewer minority persons in each group, and sometimes a greater resistance to change along with a more static environment where change in all facts of life is slow to non-existent.

Q. #5: An approach that would show the value of minority, ethnic groups to society, our need for them in a country where population is declining and aging where our social systems are threatened because of too small a tax base.

Quest. # 66 (Municipal Government)

Q. #4: FCM's Race Relations Officers should appear at Council meetings to familiarize and educate municipal officials on these issues - it is costly but the benefits derived could have far reaching impacts.

Q. #5: Consult with established R.R. committees on issues and concerns specific to the Municipality and develop an overall program.

Quest. # 41 (Municipal Government)

Q. #5: We have to know what exists first before coming up with propositions.

Quest. # 47 (Municipal Government)

Q. #4: Better distribution of documents so that the initiatives will get better known

Quest. # 24 (Other)

Q. #4: Publicise the initiatives undertaken until now

contd....

RESPONDENTS' OTHER COMMENTS

The last question on the survey questionnaire invited the respondents to make any other comments they may have. 14 respondent made some comments. These comments are as follows:

Quest. # 1 (Community Organization)

The FCM should target a forum towards the Colleges and Universities that train managers and business administrators, for the purpose of developing a mechanism or component in their curriculum that deals with sensitizing the students to the benefits of business utilizing fully the human resources available in their municipalities before reaching out elsewhere for talent.

Quest. # 64 (Other)

Race Relations committees such as the Advisory Committee on Visible Minorities established in Ottawa have played an extremely important and effective role in the cross-cultural sensitization and socialization process. This is reflected the positive changing portrayal of minorities in the media, in terms of employment, in regard to policing issues, etc. More than any organizations or groups, race relations committees have promoted and incorporated harmonious race relations in the area where it is most required, the local grass route level.

Quest. # 45 (Municipal Government)

Congratulations on your questionnaire and involvement. It is exciting to see an organization like the FCM taking a lead role in this area.

Quest. # 53 (Municipal Government)

We are also receiving considerable material on the same subject form the Ministry of Citizenship Ontario. There appears to be duplication of effort. Suggest some form of co-ordination.

Quest. # 32 (Municipal Government)

This is a difficult questionnaire to respond to unless the responder is fully knowledgeable about the activities of the Race Relations Committee. I'm not and therefore my responses are less than accurate in many cases.

Quest. # 20 (Municipal Government)

( ) is a growing community of 50,000 people.

contd...

Racial mix is made up of English, Italian, Spanish, some German, few blacks and other minorities. We've had no problem to date and we don't anticipate any. We treat everyone fairly and with respect. We are an equal opportunity employer and have many ethnic persons on staff.

Quest. # 58 (Municipal Government)

As the Municipality is just now beginning to consider race relation initiative seriously is getting started. Information and supporting literature is and will become increasingly important.

Quest. # 52 (Municipal Government)

Representatives of the City are currently involved in discussions with the North Vancouver Recreation Commission on the planning of a future workshop for select staff on the topic of multi-culturalism. The workshop is being planned with the assistance of, and will be conducted by, resource people from the city of Vancouver Equal Employment Opportunity Program.

Quest. # 51 (Municipal Government)

( ) has not experienced particular race relations problems. We are prepared to respond when required or desirable.

Quest. # 37 (Municipal Government)

Question D1- refers to greater access to municipal services. It is hard to define what is meant by greater access to municipal services. If one is speaking of trying to ensure there are no barriers to accessing municipal service then there may be a point of discussion but generally municipal services are provided equally to citizens within the service levels established by council.

Quest. # 14 (Municipal Government)

It's good to see FCM taking initiative in the multiculturalism race relation area. The background materials and networking opportunities are useful.

Quest. # 59 (Community Organization)

The present efforts to improve race relations in ( ) focus on aboriginal community only and have only been received during 1990. The efforts are a sign of good will but they are isolated and cannot be effective in a system with personal institutional racism for the cost so many years.

contd....

Quest. # 66 (Municipal Government)

This committee will be pleased to being of further assistance to the FCM in any role within our Mandate and financial income.

PERSONS INTERVIEWED AND CONSULTED

Interviews and individual as well as group meetings were held with a number of individuals in conducting the study. The following is a list of people who provided their input:

1. **VANCOUVER**

Municipal Officials:

Judy Rogers, Director, Equal Employment Opportunity Program
Norma-Jean McLaren, Equal Employment Program
Hastings Institute/EEO staff
Alderman Sandra Wilking
David Rudberg, Deputy City Engineer, Engineering Dept.
Dennis Alexander, Superintendent, Yards Br.,Eng. Dept.
Sgt. Garnet Salmond, Community Relations, Police Dept.
Capt. Rick Loughrin, Fire Dept. Public Education
Joseph Sasvari, Unit Director, Health Dept.
Joslin Kobylka, Park Board
Cherry Sullivan, Public Library
Eunice Mak and Bill Smiley, Social Planners

Community Members

Meeting convened by the Committee on Racial Justice

Vivian Roy, Anglican Church of native Indians
Satnam Singh Johri, Canadian Sikh Study and Teaching Society
Tommy W. K. Tao, Coalition 33 and Vancouver Race Rel. Com.
Valmond Romilly, Harambee Centres Canada, FCM National Action Committee, C.M.A.C.
Chinmoy Banerjee, B.C. Organization to Fight Racism
Riasat Ali Khan, President, Vancouver Multicultural Society
Aziz Khaki, President, Committee on Racial Justice

Meeting convened by Affiliation of Multicultural Societies and Service Agencies of B. C. (AMSSA)

Alice Lindenberger, AMSSA
Gordon Partovi, Richmond Multicultural Society
Teresa Pryce, AMSSA
Lois Cromarty, AMSSA
Sadie Kuehn, Vancouver Race Relations Committee
Art More, University of B.C., Dept. of Education Psychology
Maryann Bird, Vancouver Race Relations Committee
Louise Sorensen, Executive Director, AMSSA

contd....

Vancouver Race Relations Committee

Meeting with a few members of the Committee

2. **SASKATOON**

Municipal Officials

Marty Irwin, City Commissioner
Shelley Chirpilo, Employment Equity Co-ordinator

Community Members

Rabbi Roger Pavey
Hameed Javed, Saskatoon Multicultural Society, Chair, Saskatoon Race Relations Committee
Joan Brownridge, Executive Director, Saskatoon Multicultural Council
Dr. Ernest Epp, Chair, Saskatchewan Task Force on Multiculturalism

Saskatoon Race Relations Committee

Met with the Committee at which the following persons were among those who attended:

Hameed Javed, Chair, Saskatoon Race Relations Committee
Alderman Pat Lorje
Joe Penkala, Chief of Police
Karon Shmon, Educational Consultant, Native Education, Saskatoon Board of Education
Representatives of: the Black community
Saskatoon Jewish Association
Immigrant Women's Organization
University of Saskatchewan

3. **WINNIPEG**

Municipal Officials

E. A. (Lea) Frame, Director of Personnel
Sharron R. Gould, Co-ordinator, Equal Employment Opportunity Program
Harold H. S. Rampersad, Co-ordinator, Community and Race Relations Committee
Carolyn Hill-Carroll, Nursing Supervisor, Health Dept. (telephone interview)
Brenda Cooke, Program Director, Winnipeg Core Area Initiative (telephone interview)

contd....

WINNIPEG contd...

Community Members

Barbara Guia, Counsellor, Immigrant Women's Assn. of Manitoba
Kathy Mallett, Original Women's Network
Sandy Funk, Co-ordinator, Ikwewak Justice Society, Indigenous Women's Collective
Heidi Streu, Manitoba Assn. for Rights and Liberties
Marty Dolin, Manitoba Interfaith Immigration Council
Gabriel Broder, B'nai Brith Canada
Suenita Maharaj-Sandhu, National Assn. of Canadians of Origins in India (NACOI)
Seech Gajadharsingh, Special Advisor, Minister of Family Services, Govt. of Manitoba

Community and Race Relations Committee

Met the Committee at which the following were among those present: (includes committee members and others)

O. T. Anderson (was a member of the FCM Task Force on Race Relations)
C. E. (Ed) Blackman, President, Local 500, Can.Union of Pub. Employees (represents City employees)
Herb Stevens, Chief of Police (had to leave because of an emergency)
Irene Karasick, Winnipeg Chamber of Commerce
Ajit Kaur Deol
Jason Jones, Manitoba Assn. of School Trustees
Mitra Chakravarty, Bengali Cultural Association
Mohinder Singh Dillon
Tej Bains, East Indian Education and Sports Group
Harold H. S. Rampersad, Committee Co-ordinator

4. **TORONTO**

Municipal officials

Mayor Art Eggleton, Chair, FCM National Action Committee (telephone interview)
Catherine Nelson, Prog. Information Officer, Housing Dept.
Charles Smith, Race Relations Dev. Officer, Metro Toronto
Maria Harara, Health Dept.
David R. Bailey, Director, General Services, Public Works
Ken Jeffers, Community Services Administrator
Bev Salmon, Councillor, Metro Toronto, and a Member, FCM National Action Committee

contd....

TORONTO (Municipal Officials cntd....)

Mary Bruce, Director, Equal Employment Opportunity Division
Jennifer Khong, Multicultural Consultant, CITYPLAN '91
Mutale Chanda, Multicultural Access Program
Lance Wilson, Multicultural Access Program
Susan Lewis, Manager, Employment Equity, Metro Toronto Police (telephone interview)
Ceta Ramkhalwansingh,Contract Compliance, EEO Division (telephone conversation)
Janice Dembo, Co-ordinator, Toronto Mayor's Committee on Community and race Relations and a member, FCM national Action Committee

Community Members

Kamala-Jean Gopie, President, Urban Alliance of Canada
D. Dharmalingam, Member, Board of Directors, Urban Alliance of Canada and Member at large, the Council of Race Relations in Policing
Manohar Singh Bal, Secretary. Ontario Council of Sikh Societies
Carlton Masters, Black Business & Professional Association
Gary Yi, President, Chinese Canadian National Council (telephone interview)

Others

Chimbo Po-Mutuma, Director, Race Relations, Metro Toronto Housing Authority
Surinder Singh Gill, Race Relations Consultant, Ministry of Citizenship
G. Bhim, Affordable Housing Action Group

5. **MONTREAL**

Municipal Officials

Abe Limonchik, Municipal Councillor
Diane Martin, Municipal Councillor
Emmanuel Alle-Ando, Charge de developpement, Societe d'habitation et de developpement de Montreal
Michele Larose, Co-ordinator, Employment Equity Program
Viviane Ducheine, Co-ordinator, Intercultural Bureau
Normand Lucas, Assistant to Director, Montreal Commission for Economic Initiatives
John Richardson, Superintendent, Region 2, Recreation and Community Services
Helene Fotopulos, Political Attache, Executive Committee

contd...

MONTREAL (Municipal Officials contd....)

Pierre Boucher, Commision for Cultural Initiatives
Karin Michnick, Intercultural Bureau
Pierre Depatie, Montreal Urban Community Police Service (telephone interview)
Jean Isseri, Co-ordinator, Intercultural Relations, Montreal Urban Community (telephone conversation)
Ramesh Singal, Employment Equity Co-ordinator, Quebec Provincial Police

Community Members

Yat Lo, Chinese Canadian National Council
Aura Bizzarri, Co-ordinator, Immigrant Women's Collective
Manny Fausto, United Council of Philipino Associations
Noel Alexander, Jamaica Association of Montreal
Martin Ore, Laotian Association
Phony Lawarn, Laotian Association
Fo Niemi, Executive Director, Centre for Research-Action on Race Relations (CRARR) (telephone conversation)

Advisory Committee on Intercultural and Interracial Relations

Alain Jean-Bart, Chair (telephone conversation)

6. **HALIFAX**

Municipal Officials

Mayor Ron Wallace, Member, FCM National Action Committee
Alderman Art Flynn
Charla N. R. Williams, Co-ordinator, Employment Equity
Mary MacLennan, Co-ordinator, Multiculturalism/Race Relations
Dr. Barry Fox, Acting Consultant, Halifax School Board
Tracey Jones, Acting Branch Head, North Branch Library
Joan Brown-Hicks, Co-ordinator, Community Services, Public Library System
Wayne F. Adams, Councillor, Halifax County Municipality
Inspector David Murphy and Constable Darrell Lysens, Halifax Police Dept. (telephone conversation)

Community Meeting organizaed by the Multicultural Association of Nova Scotia (MANS)

The following people were in attendance:

Sonny Garcia, Filipino Assn. of Nova Scotia

contd....

HALIFAX (Community Meeting contd...)

George S. Sadi, Filipino Assn. of nova Scotia
Lillian Yeung, Chinese Society of nova Scotia
Elsa Grude, Scandinavian Society
Jiwanand Bhanot, Indo-Canadian Assn. of Nova Scotia
Vivian Stephen, Canadian Lebanon Society
Mansour Daniel, Canadian Lebanon Society
Ellen Haynes, Halifax/Dartmouth Multicultural Council
Anthony J. Metlej, Heritage Language Assn. of Nova Scotia
Lynn Atwell, Dalhousie University, International Student Centre
Salma Wali, Pakistan Association
Mukhtyar Tomar, Indo-Canadian Assn.
Beverly Johnson, Confederacy of Mainland Micmacs
Vincent Syliboy, Confederacy of Mainland Micmacs
David Khokhar, Indo-Canadian Assn
Rano Khokhar, lndo-Canadian Assn.

Other Community Members

James A. Francois, Member, FCM National Action Committee
JOan Jones, Congress of Black Women and Afro-Canadian Caucus
Noel Knockwood, Director, Micmac Native Learning Centre
Maurice Lewis, Outreach Counsellor, Micmac Native Outreach
Rev. Ogueri Ohanaka, Executive Director, Black United Front

Others

Dr. Bridglal Pachai, Executive Director, Nova Scotia Human Rights Commission (telephone interview)

7. **FEDERATION OF CANADIAN MUNICIPALITIES**

James Knight, Executive Director

8. **FCM NATIONAL ACTION COMMITTEE**

Mayor Art Eggleton, Chair (by telephone), Toronto
Mayor Ron Wallace, Halifax
Councillor Bev Salmon, Toronto
Alderman Sandra Wilking, Vancouver
Janice Dembo, Toronto
Gurcharan Singh, Ottawa
Valmond Romilly, Vancouver (in a community meeting)

9. **MULTICULTURALISM AND CITIZENSHIP CANADA**

John G. Dennison, Special Policy Advisor, Race Relations and Multiculturalism
Lizzy Fraikin, Director General